# "Increase of Income and Productive Capacities of Women Heads of Family, in Upper Egypt, Regarding the Economic Impact of COVID-19" Project

Code: 2020/PRYC/000865

**Project Final Evaluation** 

**Final Report** 

Submitted to CONEMUND/ GFD

Submitted by:

NRCHROD, (NRC Consulting)

September' 2023

47 Hamed Abdel Azim STREET, Giza, EGYPT

TEL/ Mobile: 0100-1426-742; 0100-1426-743; 0100-233-4212; 01000105842

www.nrchrod.org

## **List of Acronyms**

AECID Spanish Agency for International Development Cooperation

CBO Community-Based Organization

CDA Community Development Association

CS Case Study

FGD Focus Group Discussion

GFD Gozour Foundation for Development

IGAs Income Generating Activities

KII Key Informant Interview

MOSS Ministry of Social Solidarity

MSC Most Significant Change

NCW National Council of Women

NWS National Women Strategy

SDGs Sustainable Development Goals

TIUW Training and Insertion Units for Women

## **List of Annexes:**

- Study TOR
- Study data collection tools:
  - o Questionnaire
  - o FGD
  - o Key Informant Interview
  - o Most Significant Change, (MSC)
  - o Case study

## **Table of Contents**

	Executive Summary	06
l.	Introduction and background	13
II.	Project goal, objectives, expected results and target communities	14
III.	Understanding the assignment: objective and context of the evaluation	14
IV.	Methodological and technical approach used in the evaluation	15
IV.A	. Evaluation criteria and questions	15
IV.B	Key users and stakeholders	17
V. S	tudy Implementation Methodology	17
V.A.	Phase I: Inception phase	17
V.B.	Phase II: Data collection, entry and analysis	18
VI.	Report of Analysis	19
VI.A	. Results of the qualitative analysis	19
VI.A	.Area1: Community perception of women's role in community participation	19
VI.A	. Area 2: The project within the scale of relevance, alignment, etc	20
VI.A	. Area 3: Techcnical and vocational rehabilitation of the project cadres	23
VI.A	. Area 4: Impact and sustainability	24
VI.A	. Area 5: Appropriation and Institutional strengthening, (added value and concentration)	28
VI.A	.Area 6: Equality btween men and women/ Women Economic Empowerment/	28
VI.A	.Area 7: Sustainable environmental management and respect for cultural diversity	28
VI.B	. Results of the quantitative analysis	28
VI.B	.1. Basic data	28
VI.B	. 2. Relevance:	35
VI.B	.3. Coherence and Effectiveness	36
VI.B	.4. Efficiency	37
VI.B	.5. Impact	37
VI.B	.6. Sustainability	39
VI.B	.7. Appropriation and institutional strengthening	40
VI.B	.8. Coordination and complementarity, (added value and concentration)	41
VI.B	.9. Equality between men and women/ women economic empowerment/ women rights	42
VI.B	.10. Sustainable environmental management	43
VI.B	.11. Respect for cultural diversity	44
VI.c.	Results of combined qaualitative and quantitative analysis	45
VI.C	.1. Relevance:	45
VI.C	. 2. Alignment	46
VI.C	. 3. Coherence	47
VI.C	.4. Effectiveness	48
VI.C	. 5. Efficiency	49
VI.C	.6. Impact	50
VI.C	.7. Sustainability	52

VI.C.8. Appropriation and institutional strengthening	53
VI.C.9. Coordination and complementarity, (added value and concentration)	54
VI.C.10. Equality between men and women/ women economic empowerment/ women rights	55
VI.C.11. Sustainable environmental management	56
VI.C.12. Respect for cultural diversity	56
VII.A.1. General results of the study- conclusions of the evaluation	57
VII.A.2. Lessons learned	60
VII.A.3. Evaluation recommendations	61

#### **Executive Summary**

"Increase of Income and Productive Capacities of Women Heads of Family, in Upper Egypt, Regarding the Economic Impact of COVID-19" Project

Code: 2020/PRYC/000865

## **Background**

Women in Egypt suffer from many challenges that prevent their effective participation in community processes. Despite the relentless efforts to promote gender equality, women representation in the labor market is still weak; many of them are working in the informal sector, no social security, or even minimum wages. Most of such vulnerable and marginalized groups of women exist in rural communities especially in Upper Egypt where strict masculine customs and traditions prevail and control the lives of locals.

As COVID-19 pandemic swept the world including Egypt, many serious restrictions have been imposed which impacted social networks, jobs, loss of income, disruption of economic activities, among others. So, the pandemic and strict measures applied and the consequences have negatively impacted the status of women especially those living in Upper Egypt as women there represent the majority of the poor. Further, some of them have become solely responsible to economically support their families, (household headed females) because their husbands are either not there or have been laid off due to the spread of the pandemic.

In such communities, women represent a large percentage of the informal economy, a sector most affected by the pandemic. The situation is particularly worrying in the case of female-headed households, who have lost their source of income and lack safety nets. Consequently, this project aims to improve income and productive capacities of 200 women, (vulnerable and household headed females) in 4 governorates in Upper Egypt, (Beni Suef, Sohag, Luxor and Aswan).

The project overall goal, specific objectives and expected results to curb such issues were:

## Project goal, objectives, expected results and target communities

**GO:** To contribute to protect the human rights of those most affected by COVID-19 in Egypt

SO: Improved income and productive capacities of vulnerable women in 4 governorates of Upper Egypt

#### **Expected results:**

- ✓ R1: Strengthened the system of care for vulnerable women in Upper Egypt
- √ R2: Strengthened the capacities of vulnerable women to promote an increase their income
- √ R3: Income-generating activities managed by vulnerable women
- √ R4: The monitoring of the project is shared by all its stakeholders (cross-sectional result)

Target communities: the project is implemented in 7 villages in 4 governorates as follows:

- ✓ Beni Suef: Al Nawira villae Ihnasya district
- ✓ Sohag: Al-Rawafea village- Eastern Waninah village and Baja village- Sohag district
- ✓ Qena: Al-Twairat village- Qena district;
- ✓ Al-Maris and Armant Al-HSeit Luxor district

## Description of the objective and context of the evaluation

The general objective of this external evaluation is to take stock of the project's achievements and determine the degree of fulfillment of the objectives set on the basis of the evaluation criteria that allow assessing the level of achievement of the objectives, results and indicators of the project, identify good practices, lessons learned and aspects that need to be improved and, finally, to formulate pertinent recommendations, to improve future interventions and the sustainability of the project.

In more specific terms, the evaluation should aim:

- > To measure the effects, impact and sustainability of the project after 24 months of intervention;
- > To assess the level of achievement of the project results in terms of quantity, quality and deadlines;
- > To analyze the achievement of the indicators in quantitative and qualitative terms;
- To analyze the approach used to carry out the activities;
- > To analyze partnership relationships developed;
- To identify lessons learned and good practices;
- > To identify the limitations, strengths and weaknesses of the action and to formulate recommendations and/or re-orientations, in order to consolidate the results to guarantee the achievement of the effects;
- > To compare the baseline indicators with the results achieved to determine the main impacts of the project on the target population

## Implementation plan of the study

The implementation process of the study is divided into four major phases where each phase is further broken down into sub phases. The major phases are:

<u>Phase I:</u> preparation, inception report, desk review, tool design, tool training, and sampling Start date: 19<sup>th</sup> June, (after signing the contract): this stage takes place between 20<sup>th</sup> June – 26<sup>th</sup> July 2023. This stage covers inception meeting, development of inception report, secondary data and literature review, tool design and training, and develop sample.

<u>Phase II:</u> data collection, review and quality check and report on field work, (field memory report), data entry and analysis, generating report of results). This stage takes place between 27<sup>th</sup> July 2023 and 31<sup>st</sup> August 2023. This stage covers actual data collection from the field, submission of the field work/ field memory report, data entry, analysis and development of report of results.

<u>Phase III:</u> draft study report and joint review: this stage covers the development of the study report as a first draft that will be reviewed by CONEMUND/ Gozour. This stage is expected to take place between 3<sup>rd</sup> September 2023 and 27<sup>th</sup> September 2023, (modified to be 2<sup>nd</sup> October).

<u>Phase IV:</u> Communication plan and dissemination of final report results. In this stage, stakeholders' feedback will be captured and incorporated in the final report, evaluation communication plan will be developed, and the dissemination session with stakeholders will be carried out. This stage takes place between 21 September 2023 and 17<sup>th</sup> October 2023. (Will be modified with CONEMUND).

## General results of the study - Conclusions of the evaluation

In light of the study thematic areas/ criteria, the following results/ conclusions have been reached:

- The majority of the interviewees agreed that there was a change/ transformation in the way the community perceives woman where communities have moved from rigid traditions to more open modes of thinking though with some reservation still. (90% of participants indicated the community perception of women is "positive". They were in agreement there was a certain level of change/ transformation in the way community sees and perceives women now. To explain, community members, especially males, have moved from the rigid and traditional look to a more open but cautious one. They are normally caught in the conflict between believing in women's capabilities and customs and traditions that still see women in the traditional sense. For them and others such as CDA heads, community perspective of women has greatly changed to be more positive at various levels: for example, at family level, the woman is seen as the backbone of the family in many respects such as raising children, helping them with their education, responding to house needs such as clothing, food, etc. In addition, they see her right to economic participation as an important aspect as she can support her family given the COVID-19 pandemic and its impact on the economic conditions.
- Though the pandemic is primarily a health issue, yet it resulted in global, national and local economic downturns with serious economic implications especially on the lives of the vulnerable families and communities. It has resulted in the loss of jobs, deterioration of income, devaluation, and inability to provide for basic life commodities and needs such as food, shelter, healthcare and education. This was confirmed by 100% of the interviewees who advised that their economic conditions have worsened with the advent of the pandemic.
- The study has revealed that women can be a reliable source of support and security for the family. The study has shown the excellent role women have played during and in the post-pandemic period. For example, in some cases, as men were laid off, women had to go out and work to secure income for the family and respond to basic needs. Around 96% of the women have confirmed that the communities have asked women to assume their economic role during the pandemic.
- In terms of economic participation, the pandemic has brought to light the concept of equality more into focus through practical experience. Previously, women were seen as fit only to sit at home with no opportunity for real economic participation. There were three reasons for this in fact: 1) The study has revealed that there are some obstacles that prevent women from assuming their role in economic participation. One of such obstacles is family objection, (father, husband or son) to women's going out for fear of harassment, (57.3%). Another 56.3% advised that women fear to go out for cultural reasons where communities look with doubt at women who go out. This means that women who go outside the community were frequently looked at with low respect. There was also this conflict between the way a woman sees herself which is a self-perception and the way the community sees her is a collective social perception controlled by the sum of customs and traditions. Also, lack of knowledge and skills was a real issue for women's participation. Also, lack of self-confidence and fear to fail was another area of concern. The project could help solve such issues: first, upon identification, women were provided with the appropriate training package, (vocational and business-related) which has increased their self-confidence; in terms of project implementation, some of the beneficiaries do run their enterprises from home, (hoe-based) while others have their projects within the same community. So, they do not have to go out of the community frequently. Managing the project successfully has taken the psychological out of them where they feel afraid to fail no more. Thus, communities have started to look at women as equal to man in terms of going out to work or manage their own businesses and effectively contribute to economic activities. Community-wise, it is very clear that locals agree to the idea of gender equality and inclusion in the majority of responses. About 94.5% of women have indicated so.

- 5) In a more detailed manner, women were selected to participate in the projects based on well-defined and rigorous selection criteria as per the vulnerability assessment study which indicated that these women should be: 1)heads of households (divorced, separated or widows) between the ages of 21 and 40 as their husbands have become unemployed as a result of the pandemic 2) at least be able to read and write (literate) or completed their schooling; 3) preference should be given to households with a large number of children (3 children or more); 4) Having an irregular source of income from seasonal or casual labor, which makes them more prone to economic shocks; 5) Women who have any of the above criteria, and have a vocation, or know basic vocational skills; and are willing to work and earn a living from their micro or small income generating projects; 6) Not enrolled in any social protection schemes or receiving benefits from the Egyptian government. However, there should be flexibility in this criterion, in case some families receive Takafu'l or Karama benefits, as the amounts paid are minimal and does not elevate these families above the poverty line.; 7) Households with no or minimal assets such as household appliances such as fridge, cooker, etc., as well as poor housing conditions. This is an indication of their excessive vulnerability.
- The study results have revealed that the project is suitable for the nature of the beneficiaries and the local communities, a fact that was confirmed by 100% of the women entrepreneurs. Among the reasons for such suitability is that women chose the type of project by themselves and in line with the market study. Also, the location of various IGAs is convenient for women entrepreneurs' movement where they work within the local communities and do not have to go out. The projects were, in fact, flexible. This means that such projects greatly consider the cultural dimension. We believe that one of the most important factors that helped women to succeed is criteria #5 in the selection criteria of beneficiaries "Women who have any of the above criteria, and have a vocation, or know basic vocational skills; and are willing to work and earn a living from their micro or small income generating projects". Women strong will and determination was a crucial factor combined with skill and knowledge) were excellent causes for success.
- 7) The evaluation results have shown that IGAs have helped women solve some of the household-related problems such as paying for house expenses, paying for children education fees and private tutoring, paying of accumulated debts due to money borrowed or household items that they bought in installments but failed to pay, meet basic needs, healthcare services which are normally expensive, buying children clothes, and others. The study has also provided a clear picture about the social life of beneficiaries. To explain, being able to pay off debts and other obligations has resulted in reducing domestic violence where the economic factor is a major cause for. Now in many of the projects husbands support their wives and in others are working with them where family solidarity has been regained.
- Results have shown that project objectives are in total agreement with the local plans and Egypt's vision 2030 and the National Women Strategy road-map of 2030, as it is based on the concept of economic and social empowerment of women whose role as an active member was very clear at home and community level. The most important points here: 1) The equality between man and woman which aims at giving equal opportunities for man and woman which reflects Egypt' SDGs in the 2030 strategy; 2) Economic empowerment is considered an important axis in Egypt's NSW to combat poverty and overpopulation; 3) preserving the environment and reducing climate change through training on safe waste management; 4) Reduction of all forms of domestic violence against women; 5) Importance of education and adult literacy; 6) Combat child labor. Results have also indicated that the project concept and objectives have taken on board the Egyptian government response plan of protecting the population from the present economic impact of COVID-19 by helping improve the income of the target beneficiaries.
- 9) Project activities were consistent and integrated. Activities were done on a gradual and logical basis. The process started with the identification of the communities, applying selection criteria to identify the potential beneficiaries, classification of beneficiaries according to vocation, provision of training, starting the projects, and applying the monitoring and evaluation component.

This was like a process of building blocks in a coherent manner where each step builds on the other. This systematic approach has helped in generating good impact on the lives of the beneficiaries, their families and communities.

- 10) Results show that the project objective of "improved income and productive capacities of vulnerable women in 4 governorates of Upper Egypt" has been achieved. This was verified through having: 1) a good and qualified project team in place. The team was selected based on a clear job description and clear institutional standards. Also, a good training package was provided especially to the women leaders so they can provide guidance to project direct beneficiaries. 2) Having a technical cadre capable of monitoring the project through the TIUWs; 3) the proper selection of project beneficiaries according to a well-defined selection criteria, (please see point #7 above). .4) having a monitoring system with documented records; 4) The increase in the project capital which was evident in the success stories.
- 11) MOSS representatives in all governorates have confirmed the obvious alignment and complementarity between the project objectives and activities and the MOSS social protection programs such as Takaful and Karama. The project is, in fact, encouraging the change and move from "need" to "production'. The Forsa program of MOSS is perfectly compatible with this project where it aims to move from need to production through preparation of entrepreneurs. Further, project results comply with MOSS social protection programs in terms of logic, vision and objectives.
- 12) With reference to the training venues, and training impact, women advised that the training places were well-selected in terms of convenience and proximity. This was applicable to theoretical trainings. For vocational trainings, beneficiaries needed to attend them at the city center but it was not a problem. The project has made a great impact and change in the lives of the beneficiaries especially through the trainings they received at the beginning. Such trainings are considered transformation trainings that helped in a number of ways: first, beneficiaries regained their self-confidence; second, it marked the beginning of a new era that took the beneficiaries from their dark state to a new period of hope; third, they have generated a sense of worth for the beneficiaries that they can generate impact to their socio-economic surroundings; fourth, they have ensured that beneficiaries are fully geared up to start the new project..
- 13) Results have shown that some direct beneficiaries have passed their experience to non-project beneficiaries, (other women living in the local community). This was found in all governorates and mainly in Beni Suef. This is an excellent step that shows community solidarity and willingness to help one another.
- 14) Results have also revealed that some beneficiary women have diversified the project activities, (that is to add another activity to the current/ basic activity) in an attempt to expand the project to generate more income. For example, a woman with a poultry project might be doing sewing as an additional source of income". This was found in all governorates.
- 15) The project is characterized by being technically and financially sustainable. This can be seen in the technical follow-up and support provided by the women leaders which is done according to a systematic plan. Another element of technical sustainability is the package of trainings that provided them with necessary information and skills to run their projects. Financial sustainability can be seen in the increase of project capital, maintaining updated records and ensuring ongoing bookkeeping, beneficiary financial contributions to the project and diversification in project activities.

16) In terms of calculating quantitative improvement in the life of the beneficiaries, the study shows that:

Average income before project	% families before the project	% families after the project
<le1000< td=""><td>72.5%</td><td>3%</td></le1000<>	72.5%	3%
LE1000 - <le2000< td=""><td>20.5%</td><td>64.5%</td></le2000<>	20.5%	64.5%
> LE2000	4%	32.5%
No income	3%	0%

#### Among the major findings also:

- √ 3% families had income increase of LE1500 or more
- ✓ 22.5% families had income increase between LE1000 LE1500
- √ 44.5% of the families had income increase of LE500-LE1000
- √ 30% families had income increase of LE500
- 17) Findings show that local partners and stakeholders were invited to participate in events such as the launching of the project. These included MOSS and NCW representatives, beneficiaries and women leaders participated in delivering the IGAs as well as participating in meetings as part of the project technical committee. This is very important to build on. It is also important to keep doing this process on a consistent basis.
- 18) Results have identified networking and cooperation with MOSS and NCW as an excellent tool in accelerating the process of getting security and administrative permits. This cooperation is necessary to facilitate issues related to areas of concern such as approvals, for example or other issues that might come up in the local community and related to MOSS.

#### Lessons learned

- For other similar projects that are run by women, (especially in Upper Egypt), it is crucial to engage males and elderly women from the beginning to give support to beneficiary women. Customs and traditions have a major say where the final decision to get women involved in activities is up to the husband/ father or elderly women, (mother or mother-in-law). So, it is important to include them particularly in the awareness raising sessions (gender and inclusion) as this process proved to be successful in making men more understandable and supportive of women, (as primary target) cause and issues.
- ✓ One of the elements of project sustainability is related to administrative procedures. In order to ensure continuity, the IGAS should be formally legalized (health certificate, commercial register, tax card, etc.) especially if they intend to expand. This process takes a lot of time and financial resources, so what has been done to date is considered appropriate.
- ✓ For other similar future projects, train project team on project evaluation to strengthen their skill in this area.

  It is important for any project team to understand how to utilize evaluation recommendations for any forthcoming projects.

## **Evaluation Recommendations**

- ◆ If there are plans to phase into new communities, it is important to update any market study beforehand as communities vary from one another in terms of needs and required/ preferred activities to be implemented. This was very clear in the ended project where women were given the option to identify the kind of project they can be successful at where some have chosen poultry, others have identified sewing, and others preferred to work in detergents and so on.
- ◆ It is recommended to include Refresher trainings to women leaders (responsible of the TIUWs), so that they can continue providing guidance to beneficiaries.
- ◆ As happened in the previous project and also in the upcoming, when conducting training for CBOs, it is important for the training to include a section on how to involve women in the planning process of the gender and economic empowerment component. This recommendation is based on the fact that they have accumulated a great deal of experience now at both theoretical and practical levels which allows them to talk for themselves.
- Support the marketing area through assisting beneficiaries in opening new markets. This means that one of the possible roles of the CDA is to help women find new market outlets to sell their products and hence get a wider exposure that can lead to increase in their profits.
- Continue organizing awareness raising sessions (as the ones run in a previous project developed by GFD and CONEMUND and next ones that will be done in next project that will be developed by GFD and CONEMUND), to community members (especially communities that host projects run by women), on the importance of women economic participation. This will take away the negative look that still exists for some dwellers of such communities.
- Continue the exchange of experience process among entrepreneurs within the same governorate and among the four governorates through exchange of visits to learn from each other on similar projects. Exchange of experience through field visits provides beneficiaries with on-the-ground practical experience which they get on the spot.
- For future similar projects that can be implemented in other locations, it would be good to promote successful examples from locations where the project was implemented. This has the purpose of exposing successful examples, avoiding problem areas and sharing good lessons.
- Encourage beneficiaries to expand their geographical scope through participation in exhibitions or selling points. Also encourage them to do e-marketing and link up to e-platforms.
- Expand the idea of added value by means of which, each beneficiary would extend her experience to three-five other women.
- ◆ Establish coordination and cooperation mechanism with other similar entities for exchange of experience, (e.g., other CDAs). The exchange could take place at two levels: 1) beneficiary level to learn from the projects on the ground as advised above; 2) to help CDA staff who are planning similar activities to learn from those who have already implemented such activities.
- Provide CBOs with more space and active participation in project management and participation in planning, monitoring and evaluation. This will enable them with future sustainability of projects.
- Ensure the concept of cash circulation within the community is kept intact: that is the businesswomen sell to and buy from each other as well as from other people in the same community which creates integration.

◆ Sustainable environmental management is very important for any IGA. In fact, the implemented IGAs are in line with the Egyptian and international acts where they are causing no pollution. The types of IGAs that beneficiaries are running along with the environmental awareness sessions are contributing to an improved environment. We recommend this process should continue in new/ upcoming IGAs. Whether it is training or awareness the process has to continue emphasizing environmental management, protection and waste recycling.

## **The Full Study**

## I. Introduction and background

Women in Egypt suffer from many challenges that prevent their effective participation in community processes. Despite the relentless efforts to promote gender equality, women representation in the labor market is still weak; many of them are working in the informal sector, no social security, or even minimum wages. Most of such vulnerable and marginalized groups of women exist in rural communities especially in Upper Egypt where strict masculine customs and traditions prevail. *As for COVID-19 as a current and future crisis*, global trends indicate that the pandemic will have a profound impact on the global economy. The markets and supply chains have been disrupted, business owners are either closing or scaling down operations, and millions have either started to work as part-timers, lost or will lose their jobs and livelihoods. It is obvious that COVID-19 is pushing the world's economy towards a global recession, which will be strikingly different from past recessions.

Impact on women: Women are such a powerful force and a major driving element for sustainable economic growth yet they still face obstacles to fully participate in the workforce. A strong body of evidence shows that women's participation in the national economy is critical because when women fulfill their economic potential, gross domestic product (GDP) goes up and poverty goes down. It is disappointing that in the post COVID-19 outbreak, The ILO report has estimated that full or partial lockdown measures will impact almost 2.7 billion workers, representing around 81% of the world's workforce, while the IMF projects a significant shrink in the global GDP BY 2030. The IMF has stated that while equality between men and women is an important development goal, better opportunities for women to contribute to broader economic and social development in developing economies, including higher levels of school enrolment for girls, and can help reverse trends in conflict and economic migration. As a result of the high inflation coupled with high unemployment rates and increasing poverty, vulnerable segments, especially women are expected to be the most affected category. Unemployment continues to be one of the greatest economic challenges facing youth in Egypt, thus leaving them totally dis-empowered. Moreover, the situation of COVID-19 has worsened the economic situation in the country in general and the target areas in Upper Egypt in particular. According to the UN report, (World Economic Situation And Prospects: April 2020 Briefing No. 136)<sup>2</sup> published in April 2020, economic impacts, among other sectors, are felt especially by women and girls who are generally earning less, saving less, and holding insecure jobs or living close to poverty.

In traditional and particularly rural communities as Upper Egypt, the burden of poverty falls particularly on women who face cultural barriers, restricting their access to education, quality healthcare, jobs, and fair pay. All such causes have complicated the status of women and girls. According to the UN report published in April 2020, the economic impact of Corona virus, along with impacts of other sectors, have seriously affected girls and women who are earning less, saving less, and holding insecure jobs or living on poverty line.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> https://www.imf.org/external/themes/gender/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> https://www.un.org/development/desa/dpad/publication/world-economic-situation-and-prospects-april-2020-briefing-no-136/

As COVID-19 pandemic swept the world including Egypt, many serious restrictions have been imposed which impacted social networks, jobs, loss of income, disruption of economic activities, among others. So, the pandemic and strict measures applied and the consequences have negatively impacted the status of women especially those living in Upper Egypt as women there are less educated and represent the majority of the poor. Further, some of them have become solely responsible to economically support their families, (household headed females) because their husbands are not there or have been laid off due to the spread of the pandemic.

In such communities, women represent a large percentage of the informal economy and of the sectors most affected by the pandemic (services, domestic work and care). The situation is particularly worrying in the case of female heads of households, who have lost their source of income and lack safety nets where they can turn. Consequently, this project aims to improve income and productive capacities of 200 women, (vulnerable and household headed females) in 4 governorates in Upper Egypt, (Beni Suef, Sohag, Luxor and Aswan). In light of that, the project overall goal, specific objectives and expected results that were designed to curb such issues were:

## II. Project goal, objectives, expected results and target communities

**GO:** To contribute to protect the human rights of those most affected by COVID-19 in Egypt

SO: Improved income and productive capacities of vulnerable women in 4 governorates of Upper Egypt

#### **Expected results:**

- ✓ R1: Strengthened the system of care for vulnerable women in Upper Egypt
- ✓ R2: Strengthened the capacities of vulnerable women to promote an increase their income
- √ R3: Income-generating activities managed by vulnerable women
- √ R4: The monitoring of the project is shared by all its stakeholders (cross-sectional result)

Target communities: the project is implemented in 7 villages in 4 governorates as follows:

- ✓ Beni Suef: Al Nawira villae Ihnasya district
- ✓ Sohag: Al-Rawafea village- Eastern Waninah village and Baja village- Sohag district
- ✓ Qena: Al-Twairat village- Qena district;
- ✓ Al-Maris and Armant Al-HSeit Luxor district

## III. Understanding the assignment: objective and context of the evaluation

The general objective of this external evaluation is to take stock of the project's achievements and determine the degree of fulfillment of the objectives set on the basis of the evaluation criteria that allow assessing the level of achievement of the objectives, results and indicators of the project, identify good practices, lessons learned and aspects that need to be improved and, finally, to formulate pertinent recommendations, to improve future interventions and the sustainability of the project.

In more specific terms, the evaluation should aim:

- > To measure the effects, impact and sustainability of the project after 24 months of intervention;
- > To assess the level of achievement of the project results in terms of quantity, quality and deadlines;
- > To analyze the achievement of the indicators in quantitative and qualitative terms;
- > To analyze the approach used to carry out the activities;
- > To analyze partnership relationships developed;

- > To identify lessons learned and good practices;
- > To identify the limitations, strengths and weaknesses of the action and to formulate recommendations and/or re-orientations, in order to consolidate the results to guarantee the achievement of the effects;
- > To compare the baseline indicators with the results achieved to determine the main impacts of the project on the target population.

## IV. Methodological and technical approach used in the evaluation

## IV.A. Evaluation criteria and questions:

The evaluation study applied the OECD/DAC<sup>3</sup> criteria and others which were:

- Relevance; Efficiency; Effectiveness; Impact; Sustainability: Gender: Learning: Consistency; Institutional strengthening. Further, each of this criteria was broken down into a number of questions that aimed at providing answers to each criterion. Such questions under every criterion were:

#### Relevance:

- > Is the analysis of reality adjusted at the time of identification?
- Does the implemented strategy correspond to the needs defined in the local Plans?
- > Does the intervention respond to the problems, needs and priorities of the target population?
- Was the proposed geographic and demographic coverage adequate?
- Others

#### Alignment:

- Has the Sustainable Development Strategy: Egypt Vision 2030 and the National Women's Strategy 2030 (NWS) road-map to support women's participation and their rights in Egypt been taken into account?
- ➤ Has the Government of Egypt's response plan to protect the population from the economic impact of COVID-19 been taken into account?
- ➤ Has the strategy to promote equality between women and men of the National Council for Women (NCW) at national, regional and local levels been taken into account?
- > To what extent are the project activities aligned with the programs of the social protection "TAKAFUL" and "KARAMA" promoted by the Egyptian Ministry of Social Solidarity?
- Others

#### **Coherence:**

- > Do the project activities respond to the current context of the rights holders?
- Are the different activities consistent with each other?
- How have project activities been coordinated with the Ministry of Social Solidarity (MoSS) and the National Council of Women (NCW)?
- > Is the project management well-oriented towards results?
- Others

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The five OECD/ DAC evaluation criteria are based on the conception that evaluation is an assessment "to determine the relevance and fulfillment of objectives, developmental efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability" of efforts supported by aid agencies

#### **Effectiveness:**

- To what extent has the specific objective described in the logical framework been achieved?
- ➤ What can it say about the results?
- Have the described activities been carried out according to the schedule/action plan?
- Were the activities focused on the results of the project?
- Others

#### Efficiency:

- > Does the project budget fit the activities?
- Are the tools used in the activities adapted to the context?
- Was the project team responsive to the needs of the intervention? (job descriptions, organization structure, organization procedures)
- > The geographical location of the places (TIUW, training and meeting facilities) has facilitated the proper development of activities?
- Others

#### Impact:

- Did the results of the project lead to a real and positive change in the lives of the beneficiaries?
- Has the system of indicators made it possible to measure the expected positive impacts?
- ➤ Have there been unexpected negative or positive effects? How has the project adapted to these positive or negative effects?
- > Can an improvement in the quality of life of the women participating in the project be quantified?
- Have women been harmed by the project? (in the division of labor, in the access and control of resources).
- Others

#### Sustainability:

- > Have solid commitments been generated with the institutions that hold obligations to guarantee the results obtained?
- ➤ Have the appropriate mechanisms and procedures been put in place to guarantee the availability of the necessary resources to maintain the activities once the intervention has ended?
- Is the project technically and financially sustainable?
- > Has the position of women improved as a result of the project? Have practical or strategic needs been addressed so that women can make more decisions?
- ➤ Will the changes be sustainable?
- Others

#### Appropriation and institutional strengthening:

- To what extent have the local partner and key stakeholders participated in the design, management, development/execution, monitoring, and evaluation of the intervention?
- To what extent have rights holders/beneficiaries engaged and participated in achieving the objectives and results?
- > To what extent has the initiative been taken up by the local partner and rights holders?
- ➤ Have they provided resources (financial, labor, etc.) for the intervention?
- ➤ How have rights holders participated in this evaluation process?
- Others

#### Coordination and complementarity (added value and concentration)

- How have project activities been coordinated with other stakeholders in the area that promote women's economic empowerment, such as other local, national and international organizations?
- How have project activities been coordinated with public institutions that promote women's empowerment such as the National Council of Women (NCW) and the Ministry of Social Solidarity (MoSS)?
- Others

#### Equality between men and women/ Women Economic Empowerment/ Women Rights:

- > To what extent does the project respond to the socioeconomic needs of women?
- > Has the project managed to promote greater equal opportunities between women and men?
- Has the project managed to promote real economic empowerment of women?
- ➤ Have the needs of the women been taken into consideration given the different contexts and needs in their local communities in the four targeted governorates?
- Others

#### Sustainable environmental management:

- ➤ Have rights holders been sensitized to the importance of preserving, maintaining and protecting natural resources?
- ➤ Have inputs, techniques, technologies and materials adapted to the environment of the intervention area been used?
- Others

#### Respect for cultural diversity:

- Has an equitable, culturally respectful, and conscious participation of the different interests between and within the groups involved been promoted?
- Have different worldviews been considered; imaginary; value systems; logic of action and decision making; priorities; and knowledge of the participating individuals and groups?
- ➤ Have positive potentialities and/or possible sources of conflict or resistance related to cultural aspects been identified?
- Others

#### IV. B. Key users and stakeholders in the evaluation:

The intended users of the evaluation are those directly involved in and/or managing the project. The evaluation will help GFD and CONEMUND to learn from the project implementation to guide future programming and project design. In particular, to understand more about the performance, results and effects of the intervention to guide future similar actions.

The evaluation involved representatives of key stakeholders of the project, including youth, women, men, partners, CDAs, GFD staff and others as appropriate as per agreement in the inception meeting. Special attention was paid to make sure the views of women are captured.

## V. Study Implementation Methodology

The NRC study team underwent the final evaluation in three major phases with their sub phases following sequential and sometimes, parallel tracks as per below:

#### V.A. Phase I: Inception phase:

- ✓ Preparatory/ Coordination Meeting with CONEMUND/ GFD During this stage, the NRC team attended a preparatory meeting with relevant members of CONEMUND and GFD, (mainly CONEMUND Country Representative and Gozour Project Manager) to agree on the process of conducing the final evaluation and the appropriate approach and processes to follow. Issues discussed during the meeting included the overall strategy, approach, sampling framework, sample size, locations, logistics, coordination, implementation plan/ timelines; key internal and external stakeholders to be involved at different stages, develop a clear matrix of roles and responsibilities indicating the persons involved in the evaluation at different stages and their roles; and opportunities to discuss and respond to emerging findings as relevant; a time plan including milestones and management reporting from consultant; reporting formats, audience, and ethical considerations. Based on of the discussion, a full inception report with detailed action plan was submitted to CONEMUND/ GFD.
- ✓ Literature/ secondary/ document/ desk Review The NRC team has reviewed and analyzed all available sources and documents of secondary data, reports, strategies and other documents such as project document, reports, log-frame including related indicators, planned results, target beneficiaries, locations, implementation strategy, monthly progress reports, project mid-term/ annual reports, etc. Some of these were related to initiatives, schemes and programs related to women economic empowerment, gender-based perspectives, gender equality, different practices in different regions/ governorates, learning from similar projects implemented in the same/ similar geographical areas by GFD/ others. An analytical report summarizing the preliminary findings and hypotheses was produced to be used to complement the field part.
- ✓ Design, translation and localization of the tools In light of the study objectives and questions, a section for data to be collected from the field, (field memory), was allocated. In this phase, different interview formats were designed, localized, tested and conducted with different samples as per the developed sampling framework. The evaluation team aimed to utilize a variety of data collection tools to generate and obtain both quantitative and qualitative information. The first step was the design and translation of tools in English and Arabic. Then, they were submitted for review and approval before actual training and data collection. In this context, the core questions related to evaluation criteria relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, sustainability, gender, respect for cultural diversity, etc., were also analyzed and questions related to every specific result were placed within the relevant data collection tool.

#### V.B. Phase II: Data collection, entry and analysis:

The field part employed a dual methodology of applying qualitative and quantitative tools obtaining data from different angles to respond to the study questions. The study tools were consistent with such approach where they varied between quantitative and qualitative ones. The following is a description of such tools:

- In-depth interviews: The research team conducted twenty four interviews with all relevant parties across the 4 governorates as well as at central level on the basis of 6 per governorate, (1 with MOSS rep, 1 with NCW rep, 1 with a technical partner, 1 with CDA chairman, 2 with women leaders in charge of the TIU in every governorate). Further, one interview was conducted with the Project Manager at Gozour and 2 with CONEMUND Country Representative and Project Manager. This tool and its questions responded to the first three results of the project.
- Focus Groups: the research has conducted a total of 8 FGDs on the basis of 2 per governorate (1 for men and 1 for women). It was a condition that the number per group should be between 6-10 people. They should be from among those who have lived the development of the project so as to give solid opinions. Other elements included age, sex, education, experiences, skills, and role in the community. Participants in the focus group series were

selected from lists provided earlier. The FGDs discussed areas related to the impact of women-managed projects on other family members, practice and attitudes towards women work from a gender perspective, etc. (addressing the same three results of the project). The purpose for attending the FGDs was to elicit participants' feedback on issues, activities, progress, experiences, views, impressions and visions about the project, challenges, and way forward.

Most Significant Change, (MSC): This is a purely qualitative tool that aimed to capture the development and success aspects in a story-form from the lens and perspective of the individual beneficiary, (e.g. women) without any interference from the story collector. A total of 16 stories were collected on the basis of 4 stories per governorates.

The stories were told and documented through the words of the individual beneficiaries to describe status before and after joining the project. The selected persons were from among women who directly benefited from the project.

- Case study: Case studies were developed to document the progress in beneficiaries' status from an objective/ neutral perspective. The facilitator would debate, facilitate and collect the information on the condition of the selected beneficiaries before they joined the project till present day. The process aimed at tracking progression/ regression, success, setbacks, lessons learned and future perspective. A total of 8 stories were collected on the basis of 2 per governorate. Women were selected from among those who directly benefited from the project. The case studies responded to the three results.
- ❖ Questionnaire: this tool was designed to be a quantitative one that would complement the other qualitative tools to achieve the dual purpose of presenting a comprehensive picture on the situation from a qualitative and a quantitative perspective. The target group were women in the age group 21-35 years. The questionnaire addressed areas related to results #1, 2, and 3 and all its related sub-areas.

#### Sampling framework

The four CBOs/ CDAs, (one per governorate) were used as the entry point to the communities to facilitate the process of data collection. The four CDAs are: 1) Al Nahda Association for Integrated Development in **Beni Suef**; 2) Association for the Improvement of the Status of Women and Children in **Sohag**; 3) Ana Masry Association for Development and Training in **Qena** and; 4) Al Masry for Development and Training in **Luxor**. The sample applied three approaches: 1) complete listing of beneficiaries: under this area, all the 200 direct beneficiaries were selected to be interviewed through the questionnaire. 2) <u>Stratified random sampling</u>: under this area, a list of all beneficiaries was received for fifty persons. It was divided into two sub-lists: one that contains the number of 1-25 with an interval point (where number 1 would be selected and then number 3 and then 5 and so on until a list of 13 would be selected (containing 6-10 persons as the main list while the rest would make up the substitute list, (in case any of those in the main list could not make it). This list was devoted for female FGD. The same process was applied to the other 25 persons on the list and generate the same list from male FGD. This same approach was applied to the selection and development of the case studies. 3) <u>Purposive sample selection</u>: this process was applied selecting the targets on purpose namely the MSCs.

#### **Data entry and Analysis**

The study aimed at applying qualitative and quantitative approach in processing and analyzing data obtained from the field. Analysis was done at three levels: 1) **Vertical analysis**: this aimed at understanding the content and dimensions at the level of every specific tool. 2) **Horizontal analysis**: this aimed at monitoring and documentation of similarities and differences related to the study issues. 3) **Statistical analysis**: this refers to quantitative analysis of data and tabulating them to generate indicators related to the various issues.

## VI. Report of Analysis: interpretation of the information gathered and evaluation results

Results in this report are provided at three levels:

- 1. Results of the qualitative analysis
- 2. Results of the quantitative analysis;
- 3. Results in a combined form (quantitative and qualitative)

#### VI.A. Results of qualitative analysis

This section aims at analyzing data of various tools to generate results showing similarities and differences that are related to various thematic areas in the study.

## VI.A.1. Area 1: community perception of women role in community participation especially after COVID-19 (results and implications):

The majority of those who attended the FGDs and KIIs have agreed that there was a change in the way community perceives women role where communities have moved from strict and rigid perceptions to a more open but reserved mentality. Although some women have reached the highest educational levels and assumed some of the highest positions, still the community has a cautious perception of them. Despite the tremendous global, regional, national and local cultural, social and economic changes, yet there remain those customs and traditions of masculine superiority, (though at a lesser level) as many serious efforts are exerted at community level to change that look and turn it into a more positive and less restricted one.

In light of the above, <u>opinions of the study target groups</u> have confirmed the fact that community perceptions towards women have largely changed. They have become mostly positive at more than one level: at family level, women are perceived to be the backbone of the household in raising children, helping them with their education, and meeting household needs (e.g. food and clothes). With the complicated economic conditions, the community began to be more receptive of women contribution to economic development and increase of household income. Consequently, women began to utilize the idea and turn it into economic opportunities with the purpose of proving themselves and supporting the family. Hence, the concept of working from home has surfaced where the woman can support her family and, at the same time, not to step down from her family responsibilities. Thus, ideas of simple income generating activities have appeared such as home-based groceries, raising and selling of poultry, dressmaking, etc.

COVID-19 is considered one of the most difficult time periods that the Egyptian society in general and Upper Egypt's region in particular have gone through especially that levels of poverty particularly among vulnerable women, have increased. These are the ones with low income, lost their jobs or had to leave them to attend to family responsibilities. Although the pandemic is mainly considered a health issue, yet it had its impact on the fragile economy as there is a slow growth, collapse of the GDP, increased unemployment rate, high prices of basic commodities, in addition to low household income. According to CAPMAS 2020, 61.9% of the jobs have been affected, and 41% of households cannot provide for basic commodities with Upper Egypt region being mostly impacted.

Women in temporary jobs were mostly affected and could not save any money, being the most vulnerable. They are responsible for socio-economic aspects, minors in the house, or the disabled. Despite the dark side of the pandemic, a new role for women in the community and family has emerged.

Thus, women began to receive support from their husbands and elderly women, (mothers-in-law mainly) who expressed their appreciation to the work women do in their attempts to save their families during the time of crisis.

Interviews have also revealed that women use and apply technical approaches that help achieve their goal; to explain, they use Facebook and What's App to market their products, though not at a large scale yet, yet it is gaining momentum.

#### VI.A.2. Area 2: The project within the scale of relevance, alignment, coherence, effectiveness and efficiency<sup>4</sup>:

Relevance: results of in-depth interviews have indicated that analyzing and understanding the communities comes through more than one way; the first path was CDA/CBO's big experience and understanding of local communities issues, their ability to analyze the socio-economic situation of such communities due to their accumulated experience in working with marginalized communities. The second part is related to the diverse scale of projects that are implemented in the local communities targeting villages and poor communities and placing women at the core of the activities. This has provided for a great deal of understanding of community characteristics, community needs, and the target groups. The third path which is considered the most important among the three paths; this refers to the two studies that CONEMUND and Gozour initiated in the local communities. The first is the vulnerability assessment study which aimed at beneficiary selection and criteria. The second was the market study which aimed to identify local market needs, and most important jobs that are needed for the community. It was clear the project has largely benefited from these two studies in implementing various activities that were in line with the community needs. The project has given a positive image in the target communities on women's socio-economic role inside the family in particular and the community at large given the drastic economic downturns of the pandemic and impact on the Egyptian family and the spending patterns and meeting basic needs.

As for community selection, results of interviews have indicated that selection of villages was done in complete coordination with Gozour. The basic principle for the selection was that of "community accumulated development experience", where a previous project was done before in the same communities with Gozour and CONEMUND on gender-based violence. One of the recommendations of the completed project was to implement an economic-empowerment project in the same communities to minimize the socioeconomic impact of the COVID-19 crisis.

<u>Alignment</u>: Interviews have revealed that the project design, goal and objectives are in line with the local plans in the four governorates. The project stems out of the women economic empowerment concept. This concept is not about economic empowerment only but it is also about supporting women's role inside the family and community from a social perspective. The project promotes gender equality which perceives woman as an active member that can contribute to the social change of communities. In short, the project objectives and results are in line with the Egypt Vision 2030 and the National Women's Strategy 2030, (NWS) road-map where they meet in a number of points:

1) The project works on balancing the opportunities and at the same time, gives woman an advantage of studying the market and selecting the appropriate project. This goes in line with the Egypt Development Goals for 2030. 2) Economic empowerment is core in the Egypt Vision 2030 and the National Women's Strategy 2030 to combat poverty and overpopulation. 3) Preserve the environment and control climate changes through training on recycling. 4) Reduce domestic violence and all forms of violence against women through increase of family income and involvement in work rather than getting involved in troubles and violence. 5) Paying attention to education and adult literacy as such projects require a certain deal of education. 6) Combating child labor as the project will, now, provide a suitable source of income for the family. So, there is no need for children to work.

21

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Different views of CBO board chairmen, TIUW leaders, Project Managers at Gozour and CONEMUND

The representatives of the NCW in the 4 governorates confirmed that the project directly takes on board the Council's gender strategy which goes beyond awareness or improving the economic, social or health aspects to deal with the legislative and legal framework to avoid any form of inequality while the project focuses mainly on the economic aspects and income improvement which was confirmed by the representative in Sohag who added that the national strategy of the Council aims at economic, political and social empowerment. Hence, the project is totally aligned with the Council's strategy as the entry point to achieve women economic empowerment. Further, a community like Qena was a closed one in the past. Since its establishment, the Council has been trying to reverse the prevailing customs and traditions that aimed at reducing women's role.

The Council aims to empower the family and ensure men help their wives and vice versa to increase family income and improve its living conditions. This will lead to ending old customs and traditions that look down on women.

MOSS representatives in the four governorates have confirmed that the project and its activities are totally aligned, coherent and integrated with social protection programs such as MOSS Takaful and Karama, where the Forsa program aims to transform the poor from the state of "need "to that of "production". Both projects, (MOSS and CONEMUND/Gozour) are aligned with each other in the internal logic, objective and transformation vision of beneficiary from an "aid recipient" to "producer", "business owners" and "entrepreneurs" who can influence their lives and communities.

Coherence: All respondents agreed that project activities respond to the current situation of the rights holders which was evident through a number of points; first, selection of the target beneficiaries, which is the most vulnerable and most needy group, depended from the very beginning on certain criteria: very low living conditions and income and inability to meet basic family needs. Second, in the design of its logic, the project had two main objectives: improve income and productive capacities of vulnerable women as far as COVID-19 is concerned in the 4 governorates. This was translated into a set of activities that were implemented with the purpose of meetings the needs of the target group. Third, the design of the activities was done in a simple manner that suits the target group and ensures the achievements of the required results.

Fourth, the project aimed at building the capacities of the beneficiary women in the belief that empowerment is an ongoing and comprehensive process. The whole purpose was to support women capacities to manage the project.

What made the above possible was the fact that project activities were consistent, coherent with one another and built on each other. For example, the process started with a study to select the target communities and target groups, then classifying the target according to the required vocation, then providing them with an entrepreneurial training followed by training on the required vocation so each of them can conduct a proper feasibility study for her project. Then implementation of individual IGAs took place with the required monitoring in place and holding meetings for exchange of experience. This was confirmed by the Project Manager at Gozour who advised "since we started drafting the project we had an eye on the coherence, consistency and complementarity of activities to achieve the required results". He added "we followed a meticulous process: we started first by selecting and building the capacity of the project team then selecting and building the capacities of beneficiary women through trainings that help achieve the objective and set results such as vocational and entrepreneurial trainings, then hand the project over to them while we do the monitoring; then, we started organizing the exchange of experience meetings for beneficiaries. Which all show that we follow a sequential process where each step builds on the other".

Regarding the coordination with MOSS and NCW, all have confirmed that coordination was done with them from the very beginning. This was evident in the following:

MOSS: is the administrative authority that oversees the Foundation and CBOs/CDAs and considered as the bridge through which projects pass on to the communities for implementation. Without the Ministry's administrative

approval, activities stop. In addition, there is a representative from MOSS in the monitoring committee at the level of the 4 governorates.

NCW: the Council is considered a main partner in the project. As the project is about women empowerment, capacity building, and support, it is natural that the project works closely with the Council as the main concerned authority that has relevant strategies and plans. So, it is important to do networking with as it gives momentum to the project. In addition, the Council has supplied the project with trainers for entrepreneur training. The Council is also represented in the project monitoring committee at the level of the 4 governorates.

<u>Effectiveness</u>: Interviews have confirmed that the project objective as per the logical framework has been achieved "Improved income and productive capacities of vulnerable women in 4 governorates of Upper Egypt". Some of the evidences that support this fact are:

- Available technical cadres, (e.g. women leaders) capable of doing project monitoring and providing technical support represented in the four TIUWs in the 4 governorates. Their members have been effectively trained and there is a project monitoring guide in place;
- There is a well-selected target group of 200 beneficiaries in the four governorates whose capacities have been built and skills have been improved, (both theoretically and practically), to be able to manage their IGAs in their own surroundings;
- ♦ There are 200 projects in the 4 governorates that are already running and generating income for the beneficiaries which has already contributed to improving the life quality of their families;
- There is a monitoring system that is being applied by the female leaders of the TIUWs with regular visits that are documented. In addition, every beneficiary has records of her own project.
- Increased capital of many of the projects as was evident from the success stories in the project.

In sum, the above indicates that the achieved results are satisfactory to a great extent. We can also add that this is also due to the well-planned activities that were implemented through well-prepared action plans. Further, activities were directly focused on achieving the expected results and were suitable for the target beneficiaries.

This was confirmed by CONEMUND Country Representative who indicated that 'the project objective has been 100% achieved as was stated in the project logical framework. Further, 'the IGAs financial control sheets and the total growth indicator show that most of the beneficiary women have a benefit/ income generating capacity over 25% after initiating their IGAs". The Project Manager from Gozour has supported such fact by saying "the specific objective of the project has been largely achieved as project capital has jumped in some cases to double (200%) and in some cases have reached 100%".

<u>Efficiency</u>: the various interviews have pointed out that the project budget was just sufficient. At the initial design of the project, budget allocation was fine. However, some beneficiaries complained about the insufficient funding with the delay in getting the relevant authorities' approvals, (e.g., MOSS), the rise in prices of some of the items for some IGAs due to such delay in getting the approval and hence delayed start of activity implementation, and the overall deterioration of global and national economy due to the post COVID-19 crisis and the current war in Ukraine. The 200 IGAs foreseen in the project can be implemented in any case.

The Project Manager from CONEMUND advised that "The project had to be reformulated because the donor (AECID) made budget cuts a condition for the approval of the project. Initially, 6 CBOs were going to participate in the project, but due to the budget cut, it was decided to work with 4 CBOs in order to maintain the identified activities. The budget cut was previously agreed with the director of Gozour. Despite the budget cut requested by the donor, it is considered sufficient and adequate to achieve the objectives".

The CONEMUND Country Representative said "Yes, but we have identified during the implementation that for a further project we need to include a cost for IGA's unforeseen, (for example in Sohag a lot of chicks that were distributed to the beneficiaries who initiate poultry IGA, died because of the low temperatures and due to a power cut of 2 days in the region, that did not allow the beneficiaries women to have electricity to turn on heating lamps)".

#### VI.A. 3. Area 3: Technical and vocational rehabilitation of the project cadres:

The project adopted an approach of building a solid foundation of well-prepared cadres that can manage projects, (direct beneficiaries and women leaders who provide technical support to direct beneficiaries).

A process that was done through provision of various trainings in entrepreneurship, feasibility study, gender, and technical and vocational trainings. Trainings took on board individual differences among beneficiaries in terms of understanding and applying information. Building such cadres was done in 2 steps:

<u>First, building the team: (TIUWs women leaders)</u>: 4 TIUWs were established in the 4 CBOs in 4 governorates in the following CBOs: 1) Al Nahda Association for Integrated Development-**Beni Suef**; 2) Association for the Improvement of the Status of Women and Children-**Sohag**; 3) Ana Masry Association for Development and Training-**Qena** and; 4) Al Masry for Development and Training-**Luxor**. These units are managed by 8 women on the basis of 2 women per center.

They have received trainings in economic empowerment and self-employment of vulnerable women. Trainings dealt with vulnerability assessment, livelihood and economic alternatives in times of crisis, design and management of IGAs, M&E, and preventive and curative measures during COVID-19.

<u>Second</u>, <u>building</u> the <u>capacity</u> of IGA <u>beneficiaries</u>: the project aimed at building the capacity of the IGA beneficiaries so they become able to run and manage their businesses. The flexibility of the project helped them to understand the requirements and content of each project. This was done mainly during the training workshops.

For example, in Beni-Suef, Sohag, Qena and Luxor, the various trainings were suitable to the capacities of the trainees in terms of age grouping, education, ability to grasp and utilize the information. Vocational training added to their ability to understand. The training employed the local dialect and used simple terms particularly in Qena.

Trainings were consistent with project objectives: this fact was confirmed by all trainers. Trainers in other governorates showed a good understanding of project objectives and results. They have also advised that that there is a complete consistency between the project objectives, expected results and planned trainings. In this regard, trainings were represented in Improve and develop women skills in conducting a feasibility study and market analysis in addition to other trainings such as vocational training, project management and marketing. The Luxor trainer added that the project is a continuation of a previous project that was designed to address gender-based violence while the current project aims at women economic empowerment. Further, the training content was developed in coordination with Gozour so it fits with the project objective and expected results.

#### VI.A. 4. Area 4: Impact and sustainability:

#### As for the MSC:

<u>First: at beneficiary level:</u> Results of the application of the MSC to 16 cases in the four governorates have shown that the project has made a great impact and change in the lives of the beneficiaries. This was supported by the following quotes by the beneficiaries: "the training that I attended, either theoretical or practical was an excellent one. It marked a new beginning for me. Before the training, I hated everything while after attending it, I reached a state of optimism and hope, especially that it came after the death of my husband". Further, "the trainers insisted

that we should not leave before we learn everything. I took the machine and worked and even started to market for myself before finishing the training". Lalila Abdel Rady- a beneficiary from Al-Towairat village, Qena Governorate.

"...I joined the training where we started with entrepreneurship and how to run one's project, until we reached the sewing vocational training. I mastered the process to the extent that I did not believe myself. I received my project and started with full enthusiasm. I was determined to make myself known and market myself well. I became a very professional seamstress". Iman Sadek Besada, a beneficiary from a sewing project. Armant, Luxor Governorate.

"...I joined the training where I learned how to manage and generate profit as I applied everything I got in the training". Fatma Ramadan Said- beneficiary- selling clothes. Al-Noweirat village- Beni suef.

Second: change from a dark living condition to a more optimistic and bright one, (change of life quality: the projects have helped in making great change in the lives of the beneficiaries. Though the projects are still young, they made a significant change in the quality of life of such women and their families. This was due: first, beneficiary strong will to move forward; second, beneficiary hopes to improve their life quality; third, their wish to change from a miserable social status to a better social and economic future. This could be proved through the following quotes:

"Honestly, the project made a difference in my life. In the past, we could hardly live with my husband limited income. Now, I became very strong. I can now face life difficulties and we can buy what we need". Iman Sadek Besada. A beneficiary. A sewing project. Armant-Luxor.

"We could hardy meet life expenses until COVID-19 came and everything came to a halt. My husband stopped working and we started to borrow money from neighbors. We were in a very bad condition. With the project, our conditions started to change through increasing my income. Now my and my husband's combined income can reach LE4000/ month. I began to gain experience and my self-confidence started to grow more, my network started to widen, and I started to think of ways to develop and improve my business. It satisfied and met my needs and those of my children". Ahlam Mostafa Ahmed, beneficiary. Grocer- Sohag.

Third: At the level of the families of the beneficiaries; family relations and decision-making inside the family: the project has helped in strengthening family foundations, relations and ties as the whole family gathered around the project as one unit. It has also strengthened woman social status where she has become a heard voice and can participate in the decision-making process. The following beneficiaries' quotes confirm this fact:

"The project has brought me closer to my husband who is now asking my opinion. His decision and mine have become one". Sayeda Mohamed- beneficiary. A grocer. Al-Toweirat village- Qena Governorate.

"After we received the project, my husband and I were determined to make it grow and succeed. We joined hands, (my husband, my children and myself until we bought a shop". Demiana Roman, a beneficiary- grocer- Armant- Luxor.

"I received the project and started to work. My husband stood by my side and supported me. It was a project of the family. It helped us move out of our bad condition". Fatma Ramadan Said. Selling clothes. Al-Noweirat- Beni-Suef.

<u>Second: results at case study level:</u> The results of the case study can be seen at two levels:

## Level 1: features of socio-economic condition of the family before the project:

#### 1. Features of family socio-economic condition before the project:

The socio-economic status of most of the families can be described as "bad" as specified in the selection criteria of the project. This was manifested in the family's low income and inability to afford for basic needs of food, clothes, education and health care. This situation was confirmed by quotes from the beneficiaries as follows:

"My husband used to work on tricycle for moving goods. He is infected with cataract in both eyes and is in need for medication and surgical intervention. My younger daughter suffers from kidney problems and needs a monthly

medication. My son is diabetic and needs medication as well. Problems began to grow. I could not even afford to buy clothes for children schooling; so I had to borrow clothes from people for the children. I resorted to CDAs for assistance; if someone gets sick, I would take them to the governmental hospital;

I used to take my daughter to a doctor in Cairo for follow-up. My mother used to help me as well. However, after she passed away, this source of support stopped". Hend Sidhom Abdel Rahim Mahmoud- beneficiary. A sewing project. Case study, Qena

"We could hardly afford for a living. We were living in an extended family: my husband, his father, mother and siblings. The economic condition was very bad. My father-in-law had to get a loan to afford for the house needs as my husband was a farmer and his brother was a junk dealer while the third one was a zalabyah vendor. All the house was eating from the same plate.

My father-in-law was responsible for house expenses and each of his children had to pay a certain amount every month. My husband had to pay LE1500 per month but he could not". Nesma Mahmoud. Beneficiary. Poulty raising. Beni-Suef.

"I was the family only breadwinner especially after my husband deserted us. I had a small project for selling readymade clothes with the support of my mother. Then, my mother died and COVID-19 came to exist. Due to the spread of the pandemic, people stopped buying and I started to lose. The project capital began to decrease because I used to take from it to afford for the family expenses. So, it went down from LE15000 to LE2000. Then, I started to sell at a retail-basis and use the income to support my children's education but it did not work and eventually I lost. I had to send my children to work and support the family, (one as a casual laborer in agriculture while the other had to work as a causal construction laborer". Amal Abdel-Maseeh. Sewing project. Luxor.

#### 2. Ways and means of family adaptation to emerging life conditions:

"I used to support the house expenses in a number of ways, for example, finishing up clothes manually at home; selling pickles and raising chicken for home consumption". Saadia- Qena

"I raised chicken at home to save the cost of buying them from outside the house. We had to do with what was only necessary. Private tutoring for children was in difficult subjects only such as English and maths". Abeer-Sohag

"I have skill in sewing, embroidery and crochet and produced couch coverings. I also raised chicken in addition to selling clothes". Amaal- Luxor.

#### Level 2: Features of socio-economic condition of the family after the project:

#### 1. Features of family socio-economic condition after the project: (improved quality of life):

The analysis of the qualitative data, (case study analysis), revealed that there was a quality change in the lives of the beneficiaries in the post-project period compared to the period before they received such projects. In fact, the project made a break-though in their lives. This was supported by some facts: first, gradual increase in the activities of every single project; second, women were very keen to keep part of the profit to increase the project capital; third, exchange of experience has encouraged women to look for additional activities besides the main project. Beneficiary testimonials have supported this as follows:

"The most important needs the project has met are food and clothing and, medication for my daughter. I feel no longer afraid if a child is hungry because I can afford this now. I stopped getting aid from people. I stopped borrowing money. I can now afford for my children private tutoring. I can even join a cash pool at LE200 per month and when time for my share comes, I will use the money to support my children's education. My average income now is LE2000 which increases during special seasons and occasions and special requests". Hend- Qena

"The project generates income that is sufficient for my family. We can provide for food and clothing. In the past I felt afraid to go down street for fear my son would ask for something and I do not have the money. Now, I can buy him anything. Azhaar- Beni-Suef

"My family condition has been much better than before. I do now have financial independence but, honestly if I buy anything for the house or for the children, my husband refunds me. The most important part that I liked most was making the feasibility study and calculating profit and loss and record everything. Haneya- Luxor

2. **Project sustainability:** the project is characterized by being technically and financially sustainable. This is represented in the theoretical and vocational training attended by beneficiaries before and whose elements are being applied in the projects. In addition, there is on-going technical monitoring and support provided by the TIUWs women leaders at the 4 governorates according to an already set plan.

Financial sustainability can be noted in the increase in project capital, financial contributions that the beneficiaries have made to the project, diversification of the economic activities and adding new enhancements such as phone and delivery service. This was clear in the MSC and case studies as beneficiaries insisted to continue with their businesses.

"I work on developing my skills to make the project big which is already happening. In the first cycle, I bought 23 chicken. Now, I buy 30 and 40 and am trying also to buy chicks, turkey and ducks". Saadia- Qena.

"I managed to develop and improve the project by introducing new items. In addition to poulty, I now raise ducks and rabbits. This had its economic impact where the living conditions of the family have improved". Abeer- Sohag.

"The project started with one machine. Out of the profit of the project, I bought another machine. Before operating this machine, I attended a training course on how to use it. I intend to buy a third machine when this second machine starts to generate income. I have a page on Facebook to market my product". Haneya- Luxor.

Although case studies were randomly selected, they reflect the progress that is taking place in the project. Results of the analysis have also reflected the quality move that happened in the lives of the beneficiaries and their families. It has also strengthened the family' social ties and supported the economic foundation of such families. As per the study results, domestic violence has been reduced compared to the period before the project. Beneficiaries advised that the projects have made such a difference. Most of the socio-economic issues were addressed as the project could generate income to tackle such issues that were causes for domestic violence and disturbance before. Now, there is a dialogue and understanding between husbands and wives. Women voice began to be heard and they are taking a larger share in decision-making inside the household and as far as family affairs are concerned. Many husbands and wives are moving along to look for different alternatives that would keep the project sustainable to serve their families now and in the future.

#### Third: an evaluation overview of the project from a gender perspective:

#### FGDs with men:

- > Breaking the norm of the male dominance. It also refers to a gradual change in the role of women in the community
- The emergence of a new perspective to women socio-economic role
- Relative success of decades of efforts exerted concerned entities in supporting women rights

In addition, the analysis of the FGD and results show the following:

Men in the three governorates, (except Sohag where the number of required males could not be collected), confirmed that this is a family project that had, to an extent, contributed to increase of household income. This

is because of its small funding. However, it is considered as a nucleus or seed in the form of an opportunity they have to take advantage of. In addition, the project has helped, in part, to relieve household expenses, children education and health care. This has relieved the load off the husband' shoulders.

Hence, men became more appreciative and supportive of the project. The important point here is that it has proved that women are capable of accepting challenges and proving themselves.

- Women have now great aspirations to expand their projects, diversify their goods, and meet different needs. Such aspects have given various projects reasons for sustainability. It has become a home-based job for the woman and way of supporting the family and relieve the load off the husband' shoulders for an extent.
- They are all in favor of continuing such projects for their great value and benefit. However, it would be advisable to evaluate the possibility of increasing the funds and if so by how much.

#### FGDs with women:

Participants have confirmed that the project has changed the shape of the families of the beneficiaries. First, the projects have changed the personality of the beneficiaries, their thinking, their aspirations, as there is now a new thinking in the way things are being seen now. Women attributed this to the trainings they have attended.

The project has also contributed to solving socio-economic issues. Women have become no longer involved in conflicts or domestic disturbances or troubles with neighbors as they have become pretty busy and occupied with their projects. Women have also pointed out that beneficiary women have passed their experience to other non-project beneficiaries. This was very clear in Beni-Suef where one of the beneficiaries said"In Beni-Suef, the project beneficiaries were 50 women. However, I found out that another 150 women have benefited through passing their exchange to n-n-project beneficiaries. Also, beneficiary women have diversified the project activities. For example, you can find one woman with a poultry project is interested also in and is doing a sewing activity as an additional source of income". Also, some of the beneficiaries have passed their experience to other non-project beneficiaries.

Another aspect is related to the products themselves. For example, the poultry projects have caused a reduction in prices which forced other dealers to reduce their prices as well. The same for detergents which people began to buy at a lower price thanks to the project that has caused a promotion and availability of products.

Hence, we can say that the project had no unexpected negative impact. On the contrary, there were unexpected positive areas represented in:

- Men support to women in the projects. This was obvious in a large number which was unexpected.
- Mothers-in-law were also very supportive of women in their projects. This has led to reduction of traditional domestic problems and helped the project to succeed and continue.
- Interviews have also indicated that there were no forms of social, psychological or economic abuse towards project beneficiaries.

## VI.A.5. Fifth area: Appropriation and institutional strengthening between coordination and complementarity (added value and concentration):

In terms of the design, development, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the project, the local partner and stakeholders were invited to some of the meetings that were related to the project during project stages such as the initial design, implementation, follow up and evaluation of the project activities. We have to keep into consideration that the project design was done during the COVID-19 pandemic. (Please refer to the Technical Committee meetings as an example that explains this process); there were 4 technical committee meetings where all actors such as beneficiaries, women leaders, CDAs, MOSS and NCW were represented. However, beneficiaries

full involvement later on was very important in achieving project objectives and results. Networking and cooperation with MOSS and NCW was an excellent step in accelerating the process of getting security and administrative permits.

#### VI.A.6. Sixth area: Equality between men and women/ Women Economic Empowerment/ Women Rights:

Interviews have revealed a number of facts:

- The project has increased the space for a wider level of equality between women and men. Women have contributed to increase household income and stood side by side with men in meeting basic family needs. The training and skills that women gained have enabled them to successfully manage their businesses and set gender equality by example. They were also able to participate in decision-making and giving their opinions in issues related to their families and communities.
- The project has promoted real economic empowerment opportunities for women. This has happened through 1) self-confidence where women realized they have a say in various areas especially as far as household affairs are related. 2) By preparing her for the labor market by acquiring skills and information through training to be a real entrepreneur.
- Women needs and priorities were taken into account when women themselves chose the type of IGA they want to run. Traditions were taken into consideration where women would work within their vicinity.

#### VI.A. 7. Seventh area: Sustainable environmental management and Respect for cultural diversity:

Various interviews have indicated that beneficiaries have received orientation on environmental management, maintaining and protecting natural resources. They have, for example, learned how to collect waste in poultry projects and sell it to be used as fertilizers. In the 4 governorates, the project has taken into consideration prevailing norms, customs and traditions. For example, project meetings were done in days other than market days and weekends such as Friday. Visits to the projects were also done based on prior contact with beneficiaries and in suitable times.

#### VI.B. Results of quantitative analysis

Quantitative data was mainly obtained from applying the questionnaire with the direct beneficiaries. The questionnaire was done with the purpose of finding out the extent the project has been able to meet the needs of vulnerable women, solve their problems, support their productive capacities and increase their household income.

VI.B.1 First: Basic data:

Table (1): Beneficiary marital status												
			т.	etal								
variable	Ben	i-Suef	So	hag	Q	ena	Lu	ixor		otal		
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%		
Married	38	76.0%	47	94.0%	48	96.0%	43	86.0%	176	88.0%		
Divorced	3	6.0%	1	2.0%	0	0.0%	4	8.0%	8	4.0%		
Widdow	2	4.0%	3	6.0%	16	8.0%						
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%		

Table 1 shows the characteristics of the target group. A total of 176 are married (88%), while widows are 16 (8%). at the same time, divorced women are 8 (4%). This means that the majority of the projects were done with married women within existing families (husband, wife and children). This family composition gives the project a momentum and inspires all the members to preserve it and keep it solid and successful.

	Table (2): Education status												
				Gover	norate				т.	etal			
variable	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	hag	Q	ena	Lu	ıxor	Total				
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%			
Illiterate	1	2.0%	2	4.0%	2	4.0%	2	4.0%	7	3.5%			
Literate	10	20.0%	1	2.0%	2	4.0%	1	2.0%	14	7.0%			
Primary	3	6.0%	4	8.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	7	3.5%			
Prep	12	24.0%	9	18.0%	1	2.0%	12	24.0%	34	17.0%			
Secondary/ diploma	24	48.0%	28	56.0%	42	84.0%	35	70.0%	129	64.5%			
Above middle	0	0.0%	1	2.0%	2	4.0%	0	0.0%	3	1.5%			
University	0	0.0%	5	10.0%	1	2.0%	0	0.0%	6	3.0%			
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%			

Table 2 explains the educational status of the beneficiaries. A total of 129 beneficiaries (64.5%) have middle education while 34 (17%) have preparatory school certificate literates are 14 (7%) while illiterates are 7 (3.5%). those who hold a university degree were 6 (3%) 5 of them are in Sohag and 1 in Qena. Those who are in the category of above middle education are 3 (1.5%).

	Table (3): Number of family members in education age												
				Gover	norate				Total				
Variable	Beni-Suef		Sohag		Qena		Luxor		Total				
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%			
0	4	8.0%	3	6.0%	3	6.0%	6	12.0%	16	8.0%			
1	11	22.0%	4	8.0%	7	14.0%	5	10.0%	27	13.5%			
2	18	36.0%	10	20.0%	15	30.0%	17	34.0%	60	30.0%			
3	10	20.0%	12	24.0%	12	24.0%	12	24.0%	46	23.0%			
4	6	12.0%	16	32.0%	10	20.0%	9	18.0%	41	20.5%			
5	1	2.0%	4	8.0%	3	6.0%	1	2.0%	9	4.5%			
6	0	0.0%	1	2.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	0.5%			
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%			

Table 3 shows that 60 families (30%) of the 200 beneficiaries have at least 2 children in education age while those with three were 46 families (23%). Those with 4 were 41 families (20.5%) while those with 5 were 9 families (4.5%). Those with 6 was just 1 family (0.5%). Those with no children in education are 16 families (8%).

	Table (4): Family members with chronic diseases													
		Total												
Variable	Beni-Suef		So	hag	Q	ena	Lu	ıxor	10	otai				
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%				
0	40	80.0%	37	74.0%	35	70.0%	36	72.0%	148	74.0%				
1	10	20.0%	12	24.0%	11	22.0%	10	20.0%	43	21.5%				
2	0	0.0%	1	2.0%	3	6.0%	2	4.0%	6	3.0%				
3	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	2.0%	2	4.0%	3	1.5%				
Total	50	100.0 %	50	100.0 %	50	100.0 %	50	100.0 %	200	100.0 %				

Table 4 shows number of family members with chronic diseases. As per the table, 148 families (74%) have no one suffering from any chronic disease. At the same time, 43 families, (21.5%) have a member with a chronic disease while those with 2 members with chronic disease as 6 families (3%); finally, those with 3 members at least with chronic disease to be 3 families (1.5%).

	Table (5): Family members working													
		Governorate												
Variable	Beni-Suef		Sohag		Qena		Luxor		Total					
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%				
0	12.0%	9	18.0%	6	12.0%	15	30.0%	36	18.0%					
1	24	48.0%	39	78.0%	27	54.0%	34	68.0%	124	62.0%				
2	18	36.0%	2	4.0%	17	34.0%	0	0.0%	37	18.5%				
3	2	4.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	2	1.0%				
4	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	2.0%	1	0.5%				
Total	50	100.0 %	50	100.0 %	50	100.0 %	50	100.0 %	200	100.0 %				

Table 5 shows the number of working people in the family. As for those who have no one working were 36 families (18%). Those with one working member were 124 families (62%); those with 2 were 37 families (18.5%) and are mostly in Beni-Suef and Qena. Those with 3 were 2 families (1%). Those with 4 was 1 family (0.5%). It is to be noted that those who work are part-time, temporary and casual laborers. They can work for one day or a few hours per day at a very low wage such as apprentice or house maid. Even those with more than one member represent a very low percent that does not exceed 1%) and all at very low paid and minor jobs.

Table (6): Family members in marriage age												
	Governorate											
Variable	Beni-Suef		Sc	hag	Q	ena	Lu	ıxor	10	otal		
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%		
0	47	94.0%	37	74.0%	39	81.3%	46	92.0%	171	85.5		
1	3	6.0%	8	16.0%	9	18.8%	4	8.0%	24	12		
2	0	0.0%	3	6.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	3	1.5		
3	0	0.0%	2	4.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	2	1		
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	48	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%		

Table 6 shows that 171 families, (85.5%) have no one in marriage age. Those who have at least one member were 24 families (12%) while those with 2 members with 3 families representing (1.5%). Those with 4 members was 1 family only (0.5%).

Table (7): Family members with disability												
		Governorate										
Variable	Beni-Suef		Sc	hag	Q	ena	Lu	ıxor	10	otal		
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%		
0	42	84.0%	36	73.5%	49	98.0%	39	78.0%	167	83.5%		
1	8	16.0%	11	22.4%	1	2.0%	11	22.0%	31	15.5%		
2	0	0.0%	1	2.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	0.5%		
4	0	0.0%	1	2.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	0.5%		
Total	50	100.0%	49	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%		

Table7 shows that 167 families (83.5%) have no members with disability. Those with at least 1 disabled were 31 families (15.5%) distributed among Sohag, Luxor and Beni-Suef while those with 2 or 4 members was 1 family in each category and the two are in Sohag with (0.5%).

Table (8): Sources of family income											
		Total									
Variable	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	hag	Q	ena	Lu	ıxor	10	otai	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	
Takaful & Karama pension	5	10.0%	9	18.0%	17	34.0%	15	30.0%	46	23.0%	
Work of a family member	17	34.0%	33	66.0%	32	64.0%	28	56.0%	110	55.0%	
Own business	27	54.0%	4	8.0%	1	2.0%	2	4.0%	34	17.0%	
Others	1	2.0%	4	8.0%	0	0.0%	5	10.0%	10	5.0%	
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%	

Table 8 shows that, 110 families, (55%) have confirmed that the family main source of income was "a family working member" while 46 families (23%) receive Takaful and Karama pension. Also, 34 families (17%) have indicated that they have their own business while 10 families (5%) have confirmed to have other sources of income represented in aid and help). It is to be noted that most of such jobs are part-time or casual activities that could last for days and the income from such jobs is normally meager that can hardly afford for any major need that needs to be met.. For those who are working, these are minor part-time low-paid wages that would last for a few hours per week.

	Table (9): Provides answers to Q: community perception of women												
			Total										
Variables	Ве	ni-Suef		Sohag		Qena	Lu	xor	10	lai			
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%			
Positive	41	82%	43	86.0%	47	94.0%	49	98.0%	180	90.0%			
Negative	9	18%	7	14.0%	3	6%	1	2.0%	20	10.0%			
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%			

Table 9 shows beneficiary responses regarding community perspective of women. A total of 180 beneficiaries (90%) confirmed that the community has a positive look while 20 families (10%) confirmed the opposite, e.g. community has a negative look of women. These were mainly in Beni-Suef (9) and Sohag, (7).

Table (10) Q: In case of "positive" -why does the community see her like that? Multiple choice											
Variable	Res	Percent									
	N	Percent	of Cases								
increased level of education in the community generated values that .	84	25.0%	46.7%								
support women rights											
increased level of female education	80	23.8%	44.4%								

81

91

336

24.1%

27.1%

100.0%

45.0%

50.6%

186.7%

Table 10 shows the justifications/ factors for the community positive look. These came as follows:

women became able to effectively participate in the economic affairs of the

Women going out to work have generated great leadership potentials that

have helped women to effectively participate in the community affairs

family

**Total** 

Going out to work has created great leadership potentials where she participates in community affairs. This was confirmed by 91 respondents out of the 180 with 50.6%. The second factor was the increase in the number of educated people in the community with 84 respondents, (46.7%). Third, woman became capable of effectively participating in the management of family economic affairs, 81 respondents (45%). Fourth, the increase in the number of educated females with 80 respondents, (45%).

Table 11: Provides answers to Q: In case of negative-why does the community see her like that?										
Variable!	Re	sponses	Percent of							
	N	Percent	Cases							
people believe that women are fit only for domestic work	14	41.2%	70.0%							
women do not have the capability to wisely manage the affairs	5	14.7%	25.0%							
including women in any affair ruins it	1	2.9%	5.0%							
low awareness and low education of women makes the community look at her in a trivial way	7	20.6%	35.0%							
prevalence of the masculine look in the community generates values of lack of woman's role in the community	7	20.6%	35.0%							
Total	34	100.0%	170.0%							

Table 11 shows that the community sees woman like that because of: Some believe that a woman is fit only for house work. This was confirmed by 14 women out of 20, (70%). Second, lack of women awareness and low level of education and the dominance of the masculine tendency to control the community. This was represented by 7 respondents, (35%). Third, a woman does not have the ability to manage different affairs wisely. This was represented by 5 women, (25%). Finally, 1 person (5%) advised if a woman gets involved in an affair, she ruins it. All women, (200 respondents at 100%) agreed the economic situation of the community was affected by COVID-19.

Table 12: In case the answer was "yes", was the impact											
	Total										
Variable	Ben	i-Suef	Sohag Qena Luxor						Total		
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	
Weak	2	4.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	2	1.0%	
Strong	43	86.0%	43	86.0%	45	90.0%	50	100.0%	181	90.5%	
Medium	5	10.0%	7	14.0%	5	10.0%	0	0.0%	17	8.5%	
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%	

Table 12 shows that the economic impact of the virus was strong, a fact that was confirmed by 181 beneficiaries, (90.5%) while for 17 women, (8.5%) was medium. Only 2 beneficiaries, (1%) have indicated that impact was weak.

Table 13: What were the indicators/ evidences of such impact?									
Variable	Respo	onses	Percent of Cases						
Variable	N	Percent	Percent of Cases						
increased unemployment	99	20.6%	49.5%						
low work opportunities	140	29.2%	70.0%						
lay off labor	68	14.2%	34.0%						
low family income and inability to afford for education and health expenses	173	36.0%	86.5%						
Total	480	100.0%	240.0%						

Table 13 shows features of the Corona virus impact on the economic situation in the community. These varied in nature and magnitude. A total of 171 beneficiaries, (86.5%) have confirmed that it resulted in reducing family income and inability to provide for children education or health care. This was followed by "low work opportunities" where 140 beneficiaries, (70%) referred to this area. Increased unemployment came next with 90 beneficiaries, (49.5%).

Table 14: If the answer is "yes", what was the magnitude of the impact?											
	Takal										
Variable	Ben	i-Suef	Sohag		Qena		Lu	Luxor Total			
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	
Weak	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	2.0%	0	0.0%	1	0.5%	
Strong	34	70.8%	30	68.2%	31	63.3%	40	81.6%	135	71.1%	
Medium	14	29.2%	14	31.8%	17	34.7%	9	18.4%	54	28.4%	
Total	48	100.0%	44	100.0%	49	100.0%	49	100.0%	190	100.0%	

About 95% (190 women) of the respondents believe the virus has impacted the economic situation of women. Table 14 shows that the impact was really strong, a fact that was confirmed by 135 women, (71.1%). At the same time, 54 women, (28.4%) indicated that it was medium. Only 1 case, (0.5%) has indicated the impact was weak.

Table 15: How did COVID-19 impact you and your family?								
Variables	Re	Responses						
Valiables	N	Percent	Cases					
Less money	176	35.7%	88.0%					
No work	173	35.1%	86.5%					
My husband/ son was kicked off from work	27	5.5%	13.5%					
Did not impact us	4	0.8%	2.0%					
Unable to pay for health services	70	14.2%	35.0%					
Unable to pay for education expenses	40	8.1%	20.0%					
Others	3	0.6%	1.5%					
Total	493	100.0%	246.5%					

Table 15, (through multiple answers), shows the impact of the virus on the family of the beneficiary. A total of 176 beneficiaries, (88%) indicated that money became less. At the same time, 173 women, (86.5%) indicated "there is no work". Also, 70 women, (35%) explained that this was represented in "inability to pay for health services". Next was "inability to afford for education expenses" which was confirmed by 40 women representing 20% while 27 women, (13.5%) indicated that "her husband/ son was kicked off". Finally, 4 women, (2%) indicated that their condition was not impacted by the virus.

Table 16: Do you think that during COVID-19 the community has asked women to assume their role in making economic participation to their families?											
	Governorate										
Variable	Ве	ni-Suef	Sohag Qena Luxor			Total					
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	
Yes	44	88.0%	49	98.0%	49	98.0%	50	100.0%	192	96.0%	
No	6	12.0%	1	2.0%	1	2.0%	0	0.0%	8	4.0%	
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%	

Table 16 shows that 192 women, (96%) indicated that the community has asked women during and after the pandemic to assume their role in economic participation while 8 women, (4%) denied that.

Table 17: provides answers to Q: If the answer is Yes, how convinced the community is of such notion?											
		Total									
Variable	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	ohag Qena		Luxor		Total			
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	
Weak	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	2.0%	2	4.0%	3	1.6%	
Medium	28	63.6%	22	50.0%	13	26.0%	37	74.0%	100	53.2%	
Great extent	16	36.4%	22	50.0%	36	72.0%	11	22.0%	85	45.2%	
Total	44	100.0%	44	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	188	100.0%	

Around 188 respondents, (94%) indicated that the community is convinced of women economic rights to go out and work or manager her own project. Table 17 reflects the level and degree of community conviction of this. Available results indicate that 100 women, (53.2%) advised that they are convinced "to an average extent"; while 85 women, (45.2%) have advised "to a large extent". Three respondents only, 1.6%) indicated "to a low extent.

Table 18: Provides answers to Q: What do you think the most important obstacles that make women lose trust in the impact of their role of making economic participation inside the community are?

Variable	Res	ponses	Percent of
Variable	N	Percent	Cases
Cultural obstacles (community perspective of the woman makes her afraid to go out frequently for fear of people gossip)	108	40.4%	56.3%
Domestic obstacle (objection of husband, father, or son) against going out for fear of harassment	110	41.2%	57.3%
Psychological obstacles (lack of self-confidence and fear of failure)	35	13.1%	18.2%
Skill obstacle, (does not have any skills or experiences that qualify her for an effective economic participation	13	4.9%	6.8%
Others	1	0.4%	0.5%
Total	267	100.0%	139.1%

Table 18 shows that 110 beneficiaries, (56.3%) have confirmed that the most important obstacle is domestic, (family objection: husband, son or bother) as they feel worried that women get harassed. The second obstacle is cultural where beneficiaries themselves where 35 of them, (18.2%) would feel intimidated to go out for fear of the community look towards them and people will talk much. The third obstacle was related to skills where a woman does not possess any skills or experience to qualify for an effective economic participation. This was expressed by 13 beneficiaries representing 6.8%.

Table 19: provides answers to Q: what do you think is the required type of support for women to overcome such obstacles							
Variable	Respon	Percent of					
Variable	N	Percent	Cases				
Trainings for women in community economic participation	149	74.5%	74.5%				
			_				

qualify and raise capacity of women 18 9.0% 9.0% Networks that support women economic participation 5 2.5% 2.5% To have electronic platforms that adopt and support women 2 1.0% 1.0% economic participation Awareness sessions on the importance of women economic 26 13.0% 13.0% participation in making change inside the community 200 100.0% 100.0%

Table 19 explains the type of support women need to overcome obstacles mentioned in the previous question. Women advised that women should get trainings on their economic participation in the community. This was expressed by 149 women, (74.5%). Next was those indicated the importance of awareness sessions on the role of women economic role with 26 women, (13%). Next a total of 18 women, (9%) was represented in the need for raising women's capacities. Further, 5 beneficiaries, (2.5%) stressed the need for networks that support women economic participation and; finally, 2 beneficiaries, (1%) have referred to the importance of platforms.

VI.B.2. Relevance

Table 20: provides answers to Q: Can you tell me how did you participate in this project?										
				Gover	norate				_	-4-1
variable	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	hag	Q	ena	Lu	ıxor	10	otal
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
I had already submitted my documents to the CDA	41	82.0%	16	32.0%	2	4.0%	19	38.0%	78	39.0%
Through interacting with CDA staff who know their vulnerable condition	2	4.0%	22	44.0%	48	96.0%	27	54.0%	99	49.5%
they examined my case and came to my house and saw the situation as it stands	6	12.0%	12	24.0%	0	0.0%	1	2.0%	19	9.5%
I knew from other villagers	1	2.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	3	6.0%	4	2.0%
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%

Table 20 explains the way beneficiaries have come to participate in the project. About 99 women, (49%), have advised that their condition was already known to CDA staff and that they meet the vulnerability criteria through interacting with them and being aware of such condition; this was clearly in Qena where 48 women have confirmed that and 27 in Luxor and 22 in Sohag. Also, 78 women, (39%), have indicated they have applied before and their submission documents are at the CDA waiting for the service. This shows very clearly where 41 women in Beni-Suef, 19 in Luxor and 16 in Sohag have confirmed this. Further, 19 beneficiaries, (9.5%), have pointed out that the CDA has examined their case at their house and chose then accordingly. Lastly, 4 beneficiaries, (2%) advised to have known about the project through people of the village.

Table 21 provides answers to Q: what do you think are the problems that the project helped to resolve during	<i>i</i>
this period?	

variable	Respon	Percent of	
Variable	N	Percent	Cases
It helped increase my income	166	32.0%	83.0%
It helped with education expenses of children	119	23.0%	59.5%
It helped me pay off some debts	87	16.8%	43.5%
prove myself and contribute to home expenses	146	28.2%	73.0%
Total	518	100.0%	259.0%

Table 21 shows how the project has helped solve the problems where 166 women, (83%) said the project has increased their income; 146 women, (7%) have mentioned that it has helped her prove herself and contribute to household expenses; also 119 women, (59.5%) advised the project has helped with children education and 87 women, (43.5%) advised the project has helped in paying off some debts.

#### VI.B.3. Coherence and Effectiveness:

Table 22: provides answers to Q: If we assume the project activities were coherent and consistent with each other and encouraged you to work in the project- can you tell me how this looked like?

Variable	Re	sponses	
Variable	N	Percent	Percent of Cases
It improved my income	166	44.1	83.0%
I became a business woman	113	30.1	56.5%
It opened up my mind to new things I did not know before?	97	25.8	48.5%
Total	376	100.0%	237.5%

Table 22 indicates that coherence of project activities has impacted the beneficiaries in a number of ways: First, income has improved; a fact that was confirmed by 166 beneficiaries, (83%). Second, the beneficiary has become a business owner, which was confirmed by 113 women, (56.5%) and; finally, it opened up their minds to new things they have never known before.

Table 23: provides answers to Q: Did your participation in the project improve your income?										
	Governorate							atal.		
variable	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	hag	Q	ena	Luxor		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Yes	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%

Table 23 confirms that all participants (100%) have pointed out that the project has helped in improving their income and the income of their families. This is explained further in table 35 below.

Table 24: provides answers to Q: If yes- can you tell me how?								
variable	Resp	Percent of						
	N	Percent	Cases					
My monthly income has grown bigger than before	171	62.2%	85.5%					
I could buy new items that I could not buy before especially	102	37.1%	51.0%					
food items								
Other	2	0.7%	1.0%					
Total	275	100.0%	137.5%					

Table 24, (through multiple replies), shows that 171 women, (85.5%) have pointed out that monthly income has increased than before. Second, 102 women, (51%), mentioned that the project has helped them buy things they could not buy before such as food.

VI.B.4. Efficiency

Table 25: provides answers to Q: If No- why not sufficient?									
Variable	Resp	onses	Percent of						
Variable	N	Percent	Cases						
Money should have been two or three times the size of the current amount	19	46.3%	51.4%						
The CDA should increase the project money so we can buy new items	9	22.0%	24.3%						
Profit is not much because money is too little	6	14.6%	16.2%						
The project does not have all what customers need	6	14.6%	16.2%						
Others	1	2.4%	2.7%						
Total	41	100.0%	110.8%						

Around 81.5% of the respondents advised that the project budget was sufficient while 18.5% advised it was not. It has to be noted, however, that at the initial design of the project, budget allocation was fine and sufficient. However, with the delay in getting the relevant authorities' approvals, (e.g., MOSS), the rise in prices of some of the items for some projects due to such delay in getting the approval and hence delayed start of activity implementation, and the overall deteriorating global and national economy in addition to the Ukraine war, some beneficiaries complained about the insufficiency of funding. Table 25 explains why the money/capital has not been sufficient where 19 beneficiaries, (51.4%) advised that the capital should have doubled, (due to reasons mentioned above). Also, 9 beneficiaries, (24.3%) advised that the capital should increase so as to buy new items. Also, 6 beneficiaries, (16.2%) advised that profit is not much because money/ capital is too little.

VI.B.5. Impact

Table 26: provides answers to Q: Can you tell me what was the most positive thing about the project that has impacted you?								
Variable	Res	ponses						
	N	Percent	Percent of Cases					
People began to look at me differently, (better	117	27.7%	58.5%					
way)								
I became more eager to let my children have	112	26.5%	56.0%					
further education								
I am more eager to expand my project and keep it	191	45.2%	95.5%					
well								
Others	3	0.7%	1.5%					
Total	423	100.0%	211.5%					

Table 26 indicates that positive areas have shown up. 191 women, (95.5%) have confirmed that one of the aspects that impacted their lives is that "I became more eager to expand my project and keep it well". At the same time, 117 women, (58.5%) advised that the project helped change people's look towards women, "people began to look at me differently, (better way)". Also, 112 women, (56%), advised that the project has made them eager to get their children educated. The women have also expressed in several occasions that they believe more in themselves, have more self-esteem and now feel that they have more value thanks to the project.

Table 27: provides answers to Q: Can you tell me the things that you do not like most about the project? (Negative) and has impacted you?								
Variables	Respo	onses						
	N	Percent						
It has resulted in financial burdens for me as it does not generate any profit	1	0.5%						
It created problems for me with my husband and children	1	0.5%						
People began to look at me in a bad way	1	0.5%						
Nothing negative	186	93.0%						
Price increase	6	3.0%						
others	5	2.5%						
Total	200	100.0%						

Table 27 shows that 186 beneficiaries, (93%), advised that the project has not generated any negative impact on the lives of the beneficiaries. while one beneficiary only, (0.5%) indicated that project has increased her financial burden and another one, (0.5%) has confirmed the project has created problems between her, her husband and children while a third one, (0.5%) has indicated that the project made people look at her in a negative way. However CDAs have managed to support women overcome such problems.

Table 28: provides answers to Q: Can you tell me your family average monthly income before the project?												
				Gover	norate				Total			
Variable	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	hag	Q	ena	Luxor		Total			
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%		
< 1000	39	78.0%	22	44.0%	45	90.0%	39	78.0%	145	72.5%		
1000 - <2000	8	16.0%	21	42.0%	5	10.0%	7	14.0%	41	20.5%		
> 2000	3	6.0%	4	8.0%	0	0.0%	1	2.0%	8	4.0%		
None	0	0.0%	3	6.0%	0	0.0%	3	6.0%	6	3.0%		
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%		

Table 28 women show that family monthly income would not exceed LE1000 which was indicated by 145 women, (72.5%) while 41, (20.5%) said it ranges between LE1000- less than LE2000. Further, 8 women, (4%) advised the income was more than LE2000. Finally, 6 woman, (3%) advised the project has generated no income.

Table 29: provides answers to Q: Can you tell me your family average monthly income after the project?													
				Governorate									
Variable	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	hag	Q	ena	Lu	ıxor	TOtal				
	N	N	%										
< 1000	0	0.0%	4	8.0%	2	4.0%	0	0.0%	6	3.0%			
1000 - <2000	22	44.0%	30	60.0%	44	88.0%	32	64.0%	128	64.0%			
> 2000	28	56.0%	16	32.0%	4	8.0%	17	34.0%	65	32.5%			
None	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	2.0%	1	0.5%			
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%			

Table 29 indicates that 128 women, (64%) have mentioned that family average income has become LE1000 to LE2000. Also 65 women, (32.5%) advised that family income has exceeded LE2000. contrary to that 6 women, (3%), confirmed that income is less than LE1000 and only one family, (0.5%) has advised that family has no income.

Table 30: provides answers to Q: Can you tell me your contribution to the project?										
Variable	Respo	nses	Percent of							
Variable	Ν	Percent	Cases							
Money	93	46.0%	46.5%							
Goods	83	41.1%	41.5%							
Did not contribute	26	12.9%	13.0%							
Total	202	100.0%	101.0%							

Table 30 shows beneficiary contribution to the project. A total of 93 women, (46.5%) of beneficiaries have contributed with cash while 83 women, (41.5%) have contributed with goods. Finally, 26 women, (13%) did not contribute with anything.

Table 31:	Table 31: provides answers to Q: Did the project cause you any kind of harm/ abuse?											
	т.											
Variable	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	hag	Q	ena	Lu	ıxor	N %			
	N	%	N	%	N %		N	%	N	%		
Yes	1	2.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	3	6.0%	4	2.0%		
No	49	98.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	47	94.0%	196	98.0%		
Total	50 100.0% 50 100.0% 50 100.0% 50 100.0%								200	100.0%		

Table 31 shows that 196 women, (98%) indicted they have not been affected by any harm/abuse due to the project. Four women, (2%) advised they were subject to abuse, (psychological, domestic and social) represented in how the community looks at the woman in addition to competition with merchants. However, the CDAs have worked on overcoming such problems.

#### VI.B.6. Sustainability

Table 32: provides answers to Q: If the answer is Yes- can you tell me how? What are the indicators and evidences?

Variable	Respo	nses	
Variable	N	Percent	Percent of Cases
Project started to make profit and be known in			
village	146	38.5%	73.0%
People in the village began to ask me to buy them			
items that are missing for them	98	25.9%	49.0%
People are buying only from me and the number of			
customers has increased	85	22.4%	42.5%
I started to think of expansion and take another			
place	48	12.7%	24.0%
Others	2	0.5%	1.0%
Total	379	100.0%	189.5%

A total of 200 women, (100%), indicated that the project can grow and be sustainable. Table 32 shows that the first of such indicators is project is earning and is getting to be known among people in the village. This was confirmed by (146 women, "73 %"). Next, was "People in the village began to ask me to buy them items that are missing for them", (98 women, "49 %"). Next, "people are buying only from me and my customers have increased", (85 women, "42.5 %"). Next, "people are buying only from me and the number of customers has increased", (98 beneficiaries, "49 %"). Next "I started to think of expansion and take another place", (48 women, "24 %").

Table 33: provides o	Table 33: provides answers to Q: Does anyone from the CDA come visit you and provide you with technical support or advice?											
	Governorate											
variable	variable Beni-Suef Sohag Qena Luxor							ıxor	Total			
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%		
Yes	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%		
Total	50 100.0% 50 100.0% 50 100.0% 50 100.0% 200 100.0%											

Table 33 shows that 100% of the beneficiaries have confirmed that the CDA sends someone to visit and provide technical support and advice. The same 100% confirmed that someone from the CDA supports them with technical support/ advice. The same 100% confirmed also that someone from the CDA helps them when the project runs through a problem.

Table34: Has your work in the project helped you make decisions regarding the project, yourself and your family?											
Governorate											
variable	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	hag	Q	ena	Li	ıxor	Total		
	N	%	N	%	N	N	%				
Yes	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%	
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%	

Table 34 shows that 100% of the women have confirmed that the project has helped them make decisions either related to the project, themselves or their families.

#### VI.B.7. Appropriation and Institutional strengthening

	Respons	Percent of	
variable	N	Percent	Cases
Assist in marketing	47	18.4%	23.5%
Monitoring	194	75.8%	97.0%
Financial support	11	4.3%	5.5%
Others	4	1.6%	2.0%
Total	256	100.0%	128.0%

Table 35 shows that 194 beneficiaries, (97%) have confirmed that the CDA provides constant monitoring to the project while 47 beneficiaries, (23.5%) pointed out that the CDA helps them with marketing and 11 beneficiaries, (5.5%) have indicated that the CDA helped them with financial support.

Table 36: Have you ever been invited, at least once, to say your opinion about the project especially this evaluation

				G	ioverr	norat	te						Total		
	Be	ni-Suef		Sohag				Q	ena		L	uxor	Total		
variable	N	%	N	N %			١	V	%		N	%	N	%	
Yes	46	92.0%	50	100	100.0%		)	100	0.0%	5	0	100.0%	196	98.0%	
No	4	8.0%	0	0.0	0%	0		0.	.0%	C	)	0.0%	4	2.0%	
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%		50	)	100	0.0%	50	0	100.0%	200	100.0%	

Table 36 shows that 196 beneficiaries, (98%) indicated that they have been invited at least once to give their opinion on the project while 4 women, (2%) have indicated the opposite. This was supported by the qualitative information where local partner and stakeholders were invited to some of the meetings during project stages such as the initial design, implementation, follow up and evaluation. There were 4 technical committee meetings where all actors such as beneficiaries, women leaders, CDAs, MOSS and NCW were represented. However, beneficiaries full involvement later on was very important in achieving project objectives and results. Networking and cooperation with MOSS and NCW was an excellent step in accelerating the process of getting security and administrative permits.

VI.B.8. Coordination and complementarity, (added value and concentration)

100.0%

50

**Total** 

Table 37: Did CDA help you explore other areas to get funding from other institutions to expand/ grow your project?												
Governorate												
	Ве	ni-Suef		Sohag	10	Total						
variable	N	%	N	%		N	N %		%	N	%	
Yes	0	0.0%	3	6.0%	0	C	0.0%	1	2.0%	4	2.0%	
No	50	100.0%	47	94.0%	50	10	0.0%	49	98.0%	196	98.0%	

Table 37 shows that 196 beneficiaries, (98%), have indicated that the CDA has not helped them get funding from other institutions while 4 beneficiaries, (2%) confirmed the opposite.

50

100.0%

50

100.0%

200

100.0%

50

100.0%

Table 38: Did the project get any support from the NCW either financial or technical?													
		Governorate											otal
	Ве	ni-Suef		Sohag Qena Luxor									Ulai
variable	N	%	N	N %		ſ	V	%		N	%	N	%
Yes	0	0.0%	7	14.0%	0	)	0.0%		1	9	38.0%	26	13.0%
No	50	100.0%	43	86.0%	5	0	100	0.0%	3	1	62.0%	174	87.0%
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	5	0	100	0.0%	5	0	100.0%	200	100.0%

Table 38 shows that 174 beneficiaries, (87%), confirmed that they have not received any support either financial or technical from the NCW while 26 women, (13%), confirmed they have received support from the NCW either financial or technical to improve the project and participate in exhibitions.

Table 39: Did the project get any support from the MOSS either financial or technical?

			т.	otal								
	В	eni-Suef		Sc	hag	,	Qe	na	L	uxor		otai
variable	N	%		N		%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Yes	0	0.0%	1	2.09	%	0	0.0%	2	4	.0%	3	1.5%
No	50	100.0%	49	98.0%		50	100.0%	48	96.0%		197	98.5%
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0	0%	50	100.0%	50	10	0.0%	200	100.0%

Table 39 shows that 197 women, (98.5%) confirmed that they have not received any support either financial or technical from MOSS while 3 women, (1.5%), confirmed the opposite.

VI.B.9. Equality between men and women/ women economic empowerment/ women rights

Table 40: Do you think the project has helped you to save?													
		Governorate											
	Ве	eni-Suef		Sc	hag		Qe	ena		Lı	ıxor	10	otal
variable	N	%		N		%	N		%	Z	%	N	%
Yes	38	76.0%	39	78	.0%	32	64.09	%	46	9	2.0%	155	77.5%
No	12	24.0%	11	11 22.0% 18 36.0% 4 8.0%					45	22.5%			
Total	50	100.0%	50	50   100.0%   50   100.0%   50   100.0%						00.0%	200	100.0%	

Tables 40 shows that 155 women, (77.5%) have pointed out that they could save from the project while 45, (22.5%) confirmed they could not.

Table 41: Can we say the project has helped you to have a voice and opinion in your house?

				Total						
	Ве	eni-Suef Sohag				Qena		Luxor	10	Ulai
variable	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Yes	49	98.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	199	99.5%
No	1	2.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	0.5%
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%

Table 41 shows that 199 respondents, (99.5%) have confirmed that the project has largely helped them to have an opinion and decision inside their families.

Table 42: After the project does your community see you in a positive or negative way?

				т.	otal						
	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	hag	Q	ena	Lu	ıxor	Total		
variable	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	
Positive	48	96.0%	50	100.0%	49	98.0%	49	98.0%	196	98.0%	
Negative	2	4.0%	0	0.0%	1	2.0%	1	2.0%	4	2.0%	
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%	

Table 42 shows that 196 women, (98%) have indicated that the project has helped in making other community members see beneficiaries in a positive way.

Table 43: Based on the project, can you say there is no difference between a man and a woman in work and income for the family?

				Total							
	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	hag	Q	ena	Lu	ıxor	Total		
variable	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	
Yes	49	98.0%	49	98.0%	26	52.0%	49	98.0%	173	86.5%	
No	1	2.0%	1	2.0%	24	48.0%	1	2.0%	27	13.5%	
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%	

Table 43 shows that 173 women, (86.5%) have confirmed that the project has helped them to be equal to men and show there is no difference between man and woman in terms of work and supporting the household economically. On the other hand, 27 women, (13.5%) have denied this.

Table 44: Can you tell me what has his project added to you economically?									
variable	Ν	Percent	Percent of Cases						
Has increased work opportunities for me	95	24.4%	47.5%						
I came to know more people who can open up more	110	28.3%	55.0%						
work venues for me									
My income has increased and I knew how to make	183	47.0%	91.5%						
money									
Others	1	0.3%	0.5%						
Total	389	100.0%	194.5%						

Table 44 shows that the project has added economic value to women which can be seen as follows:

183 beneficiaries, (91.5%) have said "the project has increased my income. I knew how to do business" A total of 110 beneficiaries, (55%) said "I came to know more people who can open up more work opportunities for me". Also, 95 beneficiaries, (24.4%) said "there are many work opportunities ahead of me now".

Table 45: Can you tell me who is in control of the project and its management?											
				т.	atal .						
	Ben	i-Suef	ıxor	Total							
variable	Ν	% N % N % N % N									
Me only	23	3 46.0% 26 52.0% 46 92.0% 20 40.0%							115	57.5%	
Me and my husband	22	44.0%	14	28.0%	3	6.0%	15	30.0%	54	27.0%	
Me and my children	5	5 10.0% 10 20.0% 1 2.0% 15 30.0%							31	15.5%	
My husband only	0	0 0.0% 0 0.0% 0 0.0% 0 0.0%								0.0%	
Total	50	50   100.0%   50   100.0%   50   100.0%   50   100.0%								100.0%	

Table 45 shows that 115 beneficiaries, (57.5%) indicated they are in charge of the project and its management while 54, (27%) advised that their husbands co-manage the project. Finally, 31 women, (15%) pointed out that it is the woman and her children who run and manage the project.

## VI.B.10. Sustainable environmental management

Table 46: Did you attend any training on protection of natural resources?											
	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	hag	Q	ena	Lu	ıxor	Total		
variable	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	
Yes	27	54.0%	35	70.0%	4	8.0%	45	90.0%	111	55.5%	
No	23	23 46.0% 15 30.0% 46 92.0% 5 10.0%								44.5%	
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%	

Table 46 shows that 111 women, (55.5%) have attended trainings on environment and protection of natural resources while 89 women, (44.5%) advised they have not and these were mainly in Qena and Beni-Suef.

Table 47: Does your project contain any hazardous components or causing pollution to the environment?

				Total							
	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	hag	Q	ena	Lu	ıxor	Total		
variable	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	
Yes	4	8.0%	4	8.0%	3	6.0%	12	24.0%	23	11.5%	
No	46	92.0%	46	92.0%	47	94.0%	38	76.0%	177	88.5%	
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%	

Table 47 shows that 177 beneficiaries, (88.5%) have confirmed that their projects are not environmentally-hazardous while 23 women, (11.5%) have confirmed that their projects contain environmentally-hazardous components.

Table 48: Did you attend any trainings on recycling your project waste instead of throwing it away?										
				т.	atal .					
	Ben	i-Suef	ıxor	Total						
variable	N	%	N % N % N %						N	%
Yes	40	80.0%	37	74.0%	3	6.0%	47	94.0%	127	63.5%
No	10	20.0%	5 13 26.0% 47 94.0% 3 6.0%						73	36.5%
Total	50	100.0%         50         100.0%         50         100.0%         50         100.0%							200	100.0%

Table 48 shows that 127 women, (63.5%) have benefited from related trainings on the recycling of their projects' waste while 73 beneficiaries, (36.5%), have stated the opposite, (e.g., never attended trainings).

VI.B.11. Respect for cultural diversity

Table 49 Q: Have you been invited, at least once, before the launching of the project, to say your opinion about its activities?								about		
Governorate										tal
	Beni	-Suef	So	hag	Qe	ena	Lu	xor		
variable	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Yes	39	78.0%	49	98.0%	45	90.0%	49	98.0%	182	91.0%
No	11 22.0% 1 2.0% 5 10.0% 1 2.0%								18	9.0%
Total	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	50	100.0%	200	100.0%

Table 49 shows that 182 beneficiaries, (91%) were invited before the launching of the project to discuss the project activities while 18 women, (9%) denied that.

Table 50: Did any conflict show up with you after project implementation?										
				т.	otal					
	Ben	i-Suef	Sc	hag	Q	ena	Li	ıxor		otai
variable	N	N % N % N % N %								%
Yes	8	16.0%	8	16.0%	0	0.0%	4	8.0%	20	10.0%
No	42	42 84.0% 42 84.0% 50 100.0% 46 92.0%							180	90.0%
Total	50	50         100.0%         50         100.0%         50         100.0%         50         100.0%								100.0%

Table shows that 180 women, (90%), did not experience any conflicts after project implementation. At the same time, 20 beneficiaries, (10%), advised that they have experienced conflicts after project implementation and these were mostly domestic ones, (e.g., at family level not at community level). These were in Beni-Suef, Sohag and Luxor. They were solved out through discussion, conviction and dialogue.

### VI.C. Results of combined qualitative and quantitative analysis

**This section is now** trying to provide the analysis from a combined point of view, (e.g., qualitative and quantitative) in relation to the evaluation criteria and questions.

### VI.C.1. Relevance:

## Is the analysis of reality adjusted at the time of identification?

Available data showed that understanding and analyzing the target communities came through more than one source: 1) Accumulated experience of the local CDAs in understanding and dealing with local communities in terms of social and economic conditions being at the heart of the most vulnerable communities. 2) The diverse programs being implemented by local CDAs which are based on an understanding of such communities and ensuring that women are among the top priorities and core activities. 3) Implementing two major studies has helped in setting the right path for relevant activities to take place. This path included the implementation of two studies: the market study and the vulnerability assessment study. These two studies have provided a solid base for the program design and implementation

### Does the implemented strategy correspond to the needs defined in the local plans?

Interviews have proved that the project objectives correspond to and comply with those of the local plans at the level of the 4 governorates. To clarify, the current project stems out of the women economic empowerment. The concept of "empowerment" here does not only refer to the "economic area" but refers also to women' social role in the family and the community. This project, without doubt, supports the theme of "gender equality" which perceives women as "active members" who can make the change within their social context.

#### Does the intervention respond to the problems, needs and priorities of the target population?

Information has revealed that the project meets and responds to the needs of the target population as woman economic empowerment helps her improve her family's income, improve the quality of her life, which, inherently, generates the feeling that she can contribute to the decision-making process in the family. Further, due to the project, the community now has a positive image of woman and her effective economic and social role and that she can help, especially in a time of economic turbulence the Egyptian economy is going through. There were many factors that have made this possible: women determination to join the project; good selection of beneficiaries; quantitative data, (questionnaire) showed that 100% of the women advised the project fits their social and domestic conditions;

women persistence to make the project successful, selection of activities that fit the beneficiary's experience, skills and inclinations; flexibility in project implementation made it possible for women to run them successfully where 180 women, (90% of the interviewees) confirmed that having the project home-based was an excellent step. Also, women confirmed that selection of suitable training facilities that are located within their vicinity was another excellent choice.

Further, 166 women, (83%) have confirmed that the project has helped the woman increase her income while 146 women (73%) advised that the project has helped the woman in proving herself and contribute to the household expenses. Also, 119 beneficiaries, (59.5%) pointed out that the project has helped them pay for the expenses of their children's education. 87 beneficiaries, (43.5%) advised that the project has helped them pay off their debts.

The quantitative results have further shown that the project has helped women meet some other basic needs; for instance, 158 respondents, (79%) have confirmed that the project has helped them buy some household items that they could not buy before; also, 137 beneficiaries, (68.5%) advised that the project has helped them with food supply; another46 women, (23%) advised that they could provide for their children private tutoring; 19 beneficiaries, (9.5%) advised could buy clothes for their children while 9 beneficiaries advised they could afford for healthcare services.

#### Was the proposed geographic and demographic coverage adequate?

In terms of community selection, interviews have revealed that selection was made in consultation with Gozour Foundation. The foundation set out based on a clear strategy based on "accumulative development". The current communities where the project is taking place are the same communities where a previous project on gender-based violence was implemented with the same CDAs and same donor. One of the recommendations of the previous project was to implement economic activities for women in the same communities.

#### VI.C.2. Alignment:

Has the Sustainable Development Strategy: Egypt Vision 2030 and the National Women's Strategy 2030 (NWS) road map to support women's participation and their rights in Egypt been taken into account?

According to the qualitative data that is available, the project objectives correspond to and comply with the SDG: Egypt vision 2030 and NWS 2030 road map in a number of points:

- The concept of equality. This refers to providing equal opportunities for both man and woman. This project works on ensuring a balance through providing women with an opportunity for economic empowerment. Women are also given an advantage of selecting the type of project they want and being assisted with the market study. This reflects the SDGs of Egypt's vision 2030.
- Economic empowerment is core in the Egypt Vision 2030 and the National Women's Strategy 2030 to combat poverty and overpopulation. In the interviews, it was mentioned that women try to bring to life many children in the belief that they are considered an economic assets, so boys can work in any vocation such as street vendors, mechanics, etc. while girls can work as house maids.
- Preserve the environment and control climate changes through training on recycling
- Reduce domestic violence and all forms of violence against women through increase of family income and involvement in work rather than getting involved in troubles and violence
- Paying attention to education and adult literacy as such projects require a certain deal of education.
- Combating child labor as the project will, now, provide a suitable source of income for the family.

# Has the Government of Egypt's response plan to protect the population from the economic impact of COVID-19 been taken into account?

Interviews have revealed that the project concept and objectives have taken on board the government response to protect the population from the economic impact of COVID-19. The process of beneficiary selection criteria was in line which was the selected beneficiary should have been affected by the pandemic. This was confirmed by the MOSS representative in Beni-Suef who said "as the project objectives are linked to the government plans, it took into account the Egyptian Government response to protect the population from the economic impact of COVID-19 where the economic empowerment is a fundamental part". The MOSS representative in Qena said "this project came at the right time to help the most vulnerable families due to the dire economic conditions due to the virus. One of the advantages of the project is that it provided the opportunity for women to select and was not imposed on them. This has helped alleviating poverty for 50 families in Qena".

# Has the strategy to promote equality between women and men of the National Council for Women, (NCW) at national, regional, and local levels been taken into account?

Interviews have revealed that the project and its objectives have taken on board the NCW' strategy of promoting equality between women and men. The representatives of the NCW in the 4 governorates confirmed that the Council's gender strategy goes beyond awareness or improving the economic, social or health aspects to deal with the legislative and legal framework to avoid any form of inequality while the project focuses mainly on the economic aspects and income improvement which was confirmed by the representative in Sohag who added that the national strategy of the Council aims at economic, political and social empowerment. Hence, the project is totally aligned with the Council's strategy as the entry point to achieve women economic empowerment. Further, a community like Qena was a closed one in the past. Since its establishment, the Council has been trying to reverse the prevailing customs and traditions that aimed at reducing women's role. The Council aims to empower the family and ensure men help their wives and vice versa to increase family income and improve its living conditions. This will lead to ending old customs and traditions that look down on women.

# To what extent are the project activities aligned with the programs of the social protection "TAKAFUL" and "KARAMA" promoted by the Egyptian Ministry of Social Solidarity?

This project is part of the efforts that aim to protect vulnerable population from the drastic impact of COVID-19 including those of the government. It came at a time where the virus has generated negative impact on the economic sector. So the time was opportune where it aimed at empowering vulnerable women in Upper Egypt economically so they can also support their families and prove they can effectively participate.

MOSS representatives in all governorates confirmed the obvious alignment and complementarity between the project objectives and activities and the MOSS social protection programs such as Takaful and Karama. The project is, in fact, encouraging the change and move from "need" to "production". The Forsa program of MOSS is perfectly compatible with this project where it aims to move from need to production through preparation of entrepreneurs.

#### VI.C.3. Coherence:

#### Do the project activities respond to the current context of the rights holders?

All participants have agreed that the project activities respond to the rights-holders which was revealed through a number of facts: First, selection of the target beneficiaries, who are the most vulnerable and neediest, depended from the very beginning on certain criteria: very low living conditions and income and inability to meet family basic needs. Second, in the design of its logic, the project had two main objectives: improve income and productive capacities of vulnerable women as far as COVID-19 is concerned in the 4 governorates. This was translated into a set of activities that were implemented with the purpose of meetings the needs of the target group.

Third, the design of the activities was done in a simple manner that suits the target group and ensures the achievements of the required results. Fourth, the project aimed at building the capacities of the beneficiary women in the belief that empowerment is an ongoing and comprehensive process. The whole purpose was to support women capacities to manage the project.

From a quantitative point of view, project activities have responded to the current situation of the rights holders. First, 166 respondents, (83%) have advised that it provided them with the skill of conducting a feasibility study. Second, 164 beneficiaries, (82%) said it enabled them to manage the project well. Third, 156 women, (76%) advised they could get new trainings. Fourth, 38 women, (19%) advised that the project has added new skills to their lives; fifth, 37 beneficiaries, (18.5%) advised the project took the fear of commerce from them; sixth, 7 beneficiaries, (3.5%) advised that the project has helped them do proper marketing for themselves. All have confirmed that the project has helped increase their self-confidence and feeling of being valuable.

### Are the different activities consistent with each other?

Qualitative and quantitative analysis have revealed that every activity was connected to the other. The process started with the selection of the village, selection and then classification of the target group in terms of vocation, entrepreneurial training, vocation training, feasibility study, activity implementation, follow-up and meetings for exchange of experience. The Project Manager advised "since we started drafting the project we had an eye on the coherence, consistency and complementarity of activities to achieve the required results". He added "we followed a very meticulous process where we started first by selecting and building the capacity of the project team then selecting and building the capacities of beneficiary women through trainings that help achieve the objective and set results such as vocational and entrepreneurial trainings, then hand the project over to them while we do the monitoring; then, we started organizing the exchange of experience meetings for the beneficiaries. Which all show that we followed a sequential process where each step builds on the other".

Quantitative results show that the coherence of project activities had its impact on beneficiaries. First, 166 women, (83%) advised their income has improved. Second, the beneficiary has become a business owner where 113 women, (56.5%) have confirmed this. Third, it helped to open up beneficiary minds which was confirmed by 97 beneficiaries, (48.5%).

# How have project activities been coordinated with the Ministry of Social Solidarity, (MOSS) and the National Council of Women, (NCW)?

Regarding coordination with MOSS and NCW, all have confirmed that there was an on-going coordination. This was clear in the following:

MOSS: is the administrative authority that oversees the Foundation and CBOs/CDAs and considered as the bridge through which projects pass on to the communities for implementation. Without the Ministry's administrative approval, activities stop. In addition, there is a representative from MOSS in the monitoring committee at the level of the 4 governorates.

NCW: the Council is considered a main partner in the project. As the project is about women empowerment, capacity building, and support, it is natural that the project works closely with the Council as the main concerned authority that has relevant strategies and plans. So, it is important to do networking with as it gives momentum to the project. In addition, the Council has supplied the project with trainers for entrepreneur training. The Council is also represented in the project monitoring committee at the level of the 4 governorates.

#### Is the project management well-oriented towards results?

The results of interviews have shown that the project had a clear vision from the beginning that helped achieve the project objectives. It depended on a conscious and gradual process in activity implementation as well as adopting a scientific approach in understanding social and economic aspects of the communities through studies such as market analysis and vulnerability assessment. The result was a strong team in place, a well-selected target group, good training packages, provision of specific skills such as communication, feasibility studies, market analysis, etc. Ultimately, the project has helped women with economic and social empowerment where they could prove they were capable of supporting themselves, families and communities.

### VI.C.4. Effectiveness:

# To what extent has the specific objective described in the logical framework been achieved? What can it say about results?

Interviews have revealed that project objective has been achieved as per the logical framework, "improved income and productive capacities of vulnerable women in 4 governorates of Upper Egypt". Some of the evidences that support this statement are:

- Available technical cadres, (women leaders) capable of doing project monitoring and providing technical support represented in the four TIUWs in the 4 governorates. Their members have been effectively trained and there is a project monitoring guide in place;
- There is a well-selected target group of 200 beneficiaries in the four governorates whose capacities have been built and skills have been improved, (both theoretically and practically), to be able to manage their IGAs in their own surroundings;
- There are 200 projects in the 4 governorates that are already running and generating income for the beneficiaries which has contributed to improving the life quality of their families;
- ♦ There is a monitoring system that is being applied by the female leaders of the TIUWs with regular visits that are documented. In addition, every beneficiary has records of her own project.
- ♦ Increased capital of many of the projects as was evident from the success stories in the project.

# Have the described activities been carried out according to the schedule/ action plan? Were the activities focused on the results of the project?

The above indicates that the achieved results are satisfactory to a great extent. We can also add that this is also due to the well-planned activities that were implemented through well-prepared action plans. Further, activities were directly focused on achieving the expected results and were suitable for the target beneficiaries.

This was confirmed by CONEMUND Country Representative who indicated that 'the project objective has been 100% achieved as per the logical framework. Further, 'the IGAs financial control sheets and the total growth indicator show that most of the beneficiary women have a benefit/ income generating capacity over 25% after initiating their IGAs".

The Project Manager from Gozour has supported such fact "the specific objective of the project has been largely achieved as project capital has jumped in some cases to double (200%) and in some cases has reached 100%".

#### VI.C.5. Efficiency:

### Does the project budget fit the activities? Are the tools used in the activities adapted to the context?

The various interviews have pointed out that the project budget was just sufficient where the project made a real change in the lives of the beneficiaries compared to the period before the project. At its initial design, the project budget was sufficient. However, for some who indicated that the budget was insufficient. Here, it is to be noted that the project came during a period of turbulent and deteriorating national and global economy due to post COVD-19 crisis and the Ukraine war combined with a delay in getting MOSS approval which, by time, resulted in the increase of the cost of some project items which caused such complaint. As for this particular point, the Project Manager advised that Gozour abides by the donor regulations. During the time the project was drafted, the budget was just sufficient. Despite that, beneficiaries could create and start their IGAs which were 200 at the end.

The Project Manager from CONEMUND advised that "The project had to be reformulated because the donor (AECID) made budget cuts a condition for the approval of the project. Initially, 6 CBOs were going to participate in the project, but due to the budget cut, it was decided to work with 4 CBOs in order to maintain the identified activities. The budget cut was previously agreed with the director of Gozour (we exchanged numerous e-mails until the budget was agreed). Despite the budget cut requested by the donor, it is considered sufficient and adequate to achieve the objectives".

The CONEMUND Country Representative said "Yes, but we have identified during the implementation that for a further project we need to include a cost for IGA's unforeseen, (for example in Sohag a lot of chicks that were distributed to the beneficiaries who initiates poultry IGA, died because of the low temperatures and due to a power cut of 2 days in the region, that did not allow the beneficiaries women to have electricity to turn on heating lamps)". Quantitative analysis showed a variation in beneficiary responses. 163, (81.5%), beneficiaries have confirmed that the project capital was sufficient. Also, 37 women, (18.5%) have confirmed the opposite where 19 of them said that the capital should have been two or three times the original amount. Another 9 said that the amount should have increased so they could buy more project items while another 6 added that less capital means less profit as the project does not have all the customers need due to the limited capital. For those who advised the funding was insufficient, please refer to the opening paragraph under this section of efficiency for clarification. At the project initial design, budget allocation was sufficient. However, with the delay of MOSS in releasing the relevant approvals, (which is beyond the control of CONEMUND and Gozour), the rise in prices of some of the items for some projects due to such delay in getting the approval and hence delayed start of activity implementation, and the overall deteriorating national and global economy, due to the post COVID-19 crisis and the Ukraine war, some beneficiaries complained about the insufficiency of funding.

# Was the project team responsive to the needs of the intervention? (Job descriptions, organization structure, organization procedures)

Interviews also pointed out that the project team was sufficient to meet the project needs as they were selected according to project needs and a clear job description and standards. For example, the project team was selected following clear institutional procedures, (advertisement, screening, interviews, final selection and contracting".

# The geographical location of the places, (TIUW, training and meeting facilities) has facilitated the proper development of activities?

Interviews have shown that training venues were suitable for the prevailing customs and traditions and the nature of women in such communities. Trainings were conducted within the vicinity to fit women conditions. They were done in youth centers and CDA premises. However, the poultry and sewing trainings were conducted in the city which were distant from the villages where women live. However, women did not object because they were interested in the training topics. After the theoretical trainings, they acquired confidence which encouraged them to move to the next step, (e.g., the vocational training).

The above was supported by the quantitative aspects. A total of 197 women, (98.5%) have advised that training and meeting venues were convenient and comfortable while another 3, (1.5%) advised that such places were not.

#### VI.C.6. Impact

#### Did the results of the project lead to a real and positive change in the lives of the beneficiaries?

Results of the application of the MSC to 16 cases in the four governorates have shown that the project has made a great impact and change in the lives of the beneficiaries especially through the trainings they received at the beginning. Such trainings are considered transformation trainings that helped in a number of ways: first, beneficiaries regained their self-confidence; second, it marked the beginning of a new era that took the beneficiaries from their dark state to a new period of hope; third, they have generated a sense of worth for the beneficiaries that they can generate impact to their socio-economic surroundings; fourth, they have ensured that beneficiaries are fully geared up to start the new project.

The projects have helped in making great change in the lives of the beneficiaries where they moved from the state of want and need to a state of hope and productivity. Though the projects are still young, yet they made such a significant change in the quality of life of such women and their families. This was due to a number of factors: first, beneficiary strong will to move forward; second, beneficiary hopes to improve their life quality; third, their wish to change from a miserable social status to a better social and economic future they can do by themselves.

The project has helped in strengthening family foundations, relations and ties as the whole family gathered around the project as one unit be it the father, mother or children. It has also strengthened woman social status where she has become a heard voice and can participate in the decision-making process.

The socio-economic status of most of the families can be described as largely bad. This was manifested in the family's low income and inability to afford for basic needs of food, clothes, education and health care.

The project analysis of the qualitative data, (case study analysis), revealed that there was a quality change in the lives of the beneficiaries in the post-project period compared to the period before they received such projects. In fact, the project made a great break-though in the lives of the beneficiaries. The project was like a build up and process that kept pushing the lives of the beneficiaries forward to achieve the best results. Owning the information/knowledge, experience through vocational training and then working on the projects gave them a sense of ownership. With the generation of income and providing for household needs and at the same time, ensuring the project is growing, has increased women self-confidence and feeling that they are on the right path. This was supported by a number of evidences: first, gradual increase in the activities of every single project; second, women were very keen to keep part of the profit to increase the project capital; third, exchange of experience has encouraged women to look for additional activities besides the main project; for example, we can find a seamstress is trying to raise chicken or ducks to save the cost of buying them from poultry shops.

Table 41 indicates that positive areas have shown up. 191 women, (95.5%) have confirmed that one of the aspects that impacted their lives is that "I became more eager to expand my project and keep it well". At the same time, 117 women, (58.5%) advised that the project helped change people's look towards women, "people began to look at me differently, (better way)". Also, 112 women, (56%), advised that the project has made them eager to get their children educated.

Table 43 shows that 97 beneficiaries, (48.5%) have indicated that the most important change was that they started to get together and think of how to expand it/ make it grow. At the same time, 67 women, (33.5%) said that the most important change the project brought to their lives is that it taught them how to make profits. Then, 34 women, (17%), advised that the most important change for them was that the project made them interested in the project.

A total of 123 families, (61.5%) advised that their family condition has improved to a large extent while 77 women, (38.5%) have indicated that their condition has improved in medium.

Has the system of indicators made it possible to measure the expected positive impacts? Have there been unexpected negative or positive effects? How has the project adapted to these positive or negative effects?

Results have indicated that there were no unexpected negative effects at the beginning. On the contrary, there were unexpected positive effects such as:

- Man support to woman in her project was obvious. This had its impact in contributing to project success
- Mother-in-law support to daughters-in-law in their projects was also noted. This has contributed to project sustainability with no problems.

#### Can an improvement in the quality of life of the women participating in the project be quantified?

Although case studies were randomly selected, yet they have shown a great progress in the quality of life of beneficiaries. The project has become an opportunity for the woman to prove that she can effectively contribute to solve family problems and she can make good decisions that can help her along that track. In the FGD for men in the three governorates, (except Sohag where the number of required males could not be collected), men confirmed that this is a family project that had, to an extent, contributed to increase of household income. This is because of its small funding. However, it is considered as a nucleus or seed in the form of an opportunity they have to take advantage of. In addition, the project has helped, in part, to relieve household expenses, children education and health care. This has relieved the load off the husband' shoulders. Hence, men became more appreciative and supportive of the project. The important point here is that it has proved that women are capable of accepting challenges and proving themselves.

In the women FGD, women advised that their self-confidence and esteem have increased with the increase in income. The project has changed their life quality. They have become more able to meet household needs, pay off debts, and afford for health and education expenses.

Women have also confirmed that the project has changed the shape of the families. It changed the personality of the beneficiaries, their thinking and aspirations. Women attributed this to the trainings they have attended.

The results of quantitative analysis support this point. For example, family monthly income would not exceed LE1000 which was indicated by 145 women, (72.5%) while 41, (20.5%) said it ranges between LE1000- less than LE2000. Further, 8 women, (4%) advised the income was more than LE2000. Finally, six woman, (3%) advised that the project has generated no income for the family.

Also, 128 women, (64%) have mentioned that family average income has become LE1000 to LE2000. Also 65 women, (32.5%) advised that family income has exceeded LE2000. contrary to that 6 women, (3%), confirmed that income is less than LE1000 and only one family, (0.5%) has advised that family has no income.

The amount of increase in income after working in the project was mentioned as follows: 89 beneficiaries, (44.5%) advised that increase has been between LE500 - LE1000. Also, 60 women, (30%) advised that income has increased by LE500. Also, 46 beneficiaries, (23%) have confirmed that their income has increased by LE1000 - LE1500. Five beneficiaries, (2.5%) advised that income has surpassed LE1500

## Have women been harmed by the project? (In the division of labor, in the access and control of resources).

Interviews have shown that the project represents no social, psychological, or economic harm to beneficiaries. This was confirmed by the quantitative data as 196 women, (98%) have confirmed that they were never exposed to any type of harm because of the project. Only 4 women, (2%) have indicated the opposite, (e.g., were subject to psychological, moral, domestic and social harm represented in the way people look at woman in the project.

#### VI.C.7. Sustainability:

# Have solid commitments been generated with the institutions that hold obligations to guarantee the results obtained?

Interviews have revealed that there are protocols of cooperation among all parties in the project notably between Gozour and the partner CBOs or between the CBOs and the NCW. There is also a natural integration between the CBOs and the MOSS Directorates being the administrative body overseeing their activities.

# Have the appropriate mechanisms and procedures been put in place to guarantee the availability of the necessary resources to maintain the activities once the intervention has ended?

Interviews did not give a clear answer in this regard except for assurances that such issue represents a core interest for the CBOs in the coming period of time. For example, Al-Masry CBO in Qena advised that they have this issue in mind in an attempt to maintain project sustainability which will be achieved through regular follow-up, serious attempts to do networking with other supporting agencies and institutions and; open up spaces for such projects by developing their way of working.

#### Is the project technically and financially sustainable?

The project is characterized by being technically and financially sustainable. This is represented in the theoretical and vocational training that beneficiaries have obtained before and whose elements are being applied in the projects. In addition, there is on-going technical monitoring and technical support provided by the TIUWs women leaders at the level of the 4 governorates according to an already set plan. Financial sustainability can be traced in a number of items: the increase in project capital, financial contributions that the beneficiaries have made to the project, diversification of the economic activities and adding new enhancements such as phone and delivery service. In the MSC and case studies beneficiaries have insisted to continue with their businesses.

Quantitative data has confirmed the same where 100% of the beneficiaries have confirmed that the CDA sends someone to visit and provide technical support and advice. Also, 100% of the beneficiaries have confirmed that the umbrella CDA helps beneficiaries in case the project faces any problems. Further, 100% of the beneficiaries have confirmed that the CDA helps the beneficiaries with their marketing.

# Has the position of women improved as a result of the project? Have practical or strategic needs been addressed so that women can make more decisions?

Qualitative data show that the project has strengthened the family' social ties and supported the economic foundation of such families. Domestic violence has been reduced and women voice began to be heard and they took a larger share in decision-making. Many family needs are met and husbands and wives are moving along to serve their families.

"The project has brought me closer to my husband who is now asking my opinion. His decision and mine have become one". Sayeda Mohamed- beneficiary. A grocer. Al-Toweirat village- Qena Governorate.

"Now I have a stable income. Myself, my husband and my children, we are all in the project. The project has increased the ties among us. Our income has increased. We can now meet children' needs. Rahma Ali Mahmoud, beneficiary. Grocer. Armant, Luxor.

"I received the project and started to work. My husband stood by my side and supported me. It is a family project that would help us move out of our bad condition". Fatma Ramadan. Selling clothes. Al-Noweirat- Beni-Suef.

Quantitative data confirms the above and shows that 100% of the beneficiaries advised that the project has helped in improving their income and that of their families.

For example, 171 beneficiaries, (85.5%) indicated that their monthly income has increased; 102 women, (51%), indicated that has helped the beneficiaries to buy things they could not buy before as in food items. 100% of the beneficiaries advised that the project has helped them with the decision-making process either in relation to the project, themselves or their families. Also, 199 beneficiaries, (99.5%) indicated the project has largely helped them to make decisions inside their families.

#### Will the changes be sustainable?

Qualitative analysis has indicated that project changes are characterized by being sustainable. This stems from the beneficiary' strong will to ensure the project continues as it represents for them a final and safe resort.

Some of the change indicators are: diversification of activities within the same project and the desire to ensure it has multiple economic arms. Also, such diversification ensures sustainability, doubles the profit and provides protection against market shakes. 100% of the beneficiaries are convinced the project can grow and continue due to their strong will and readiness. Some of the evidences on this are: the first of such indicators is that the project is earning and is getting to be known among people in the villages where the project is. This was confirmed by 146 women, (73%). Next, was "People in the village began to ask me to buy them items that are missing for them". This was confirmed by 98 women, (49%). next, "people are buying only from me and my customers have increased". This was stated by 85 women, "42.5%". Next, was "people are buying only from me and the number of customers has increased". This was expressed by 98 beneficiaries, (49%). Next was "I started to think of expansion and take another place". This was expressed by 48 women, (24%).

#### VI.C.8. Appropriation and institutional strengthening:

# To what extent have the local partner and key stakeholders participated in the design, management, development/execution, monitoring, and evaluation of the intervention?

In terms of the design, development, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the project, the local partner and stakeholders were invited to some of the meetings that are related to the project during project stages such as the initial design, implementation, follow up and evaluation of the project activities. Please refer to the Technical Committee meetings as an example that explains this process.

188 women, (94%), feel ownership and that the project belongs to them while 12 women, (6%) feel that the project belongs to the CDA. 100% of the beneficiaries who indicated ownership of the project, have confirmed to have participated in the project design as well as its management, implementation, monitoring and evaluation.

# To what extent have rights holders/ beneficiaries engaged and participated in achieving the objectives and results?

Beneficiaries involvement at the beginning and also later on was very important in achieving project objectives and results. Their insistence to participate in the project and the wish to make it successful as well as their ability to grasp and understand the training scientific material has largely helped in achieving the required results of improving income and productive capacities of vulnerable women.

# To what extent has the initiative been taken up by the local partner and rights holders? Have they provided resources, (financial, labor, etc.) for the intervention?

Interviews with the local partner and the rights-holders mentioned that the local partner provided equipment and support to the project team. For example, quantitative analysis confirmed a number of facts: the CDA provides constant follow-up, (was confirmed by 194 beneficiaries representing 97%). A total of 47 beneficiaries, (23.5%), advised that the CDA helps them with marketing while 11 women, (5.5%) advised that the CDA provides them with financial support. Also. 141 women, (71.5%), advised that they consult with the CDA in case any amendment is required while 57 women, (28.5%), advised they did not consult with the CDA.

#### How have rights holders participated in this evaluation process?

Quantitative data has shown they have participated at least once in the evaluation exercise. This was confirmed by 196 women, (98%) where they said they were invited for meetings to provide their opinion of the project and some were visited by the Technical Monitoring Committee. Also, 192 women, (96%), have advised they were asked to provide their opinion upon implementation of the project, (positives and negatives). Similarly, 182 women, (91%) advised they were invited before the project start to provide their opinion on the project while 18, (9%) denied that.

#### VI.C.9. Coordination and complementarity (added value and concentration):

How have project activities been coordinated with other stakeholders in the area that promote women's economic empowerment, such as other local, national and international organization?

How have project activities been coordinated with public institutions that promote women's empowerment such as the National Council of Women, (NCW) and the Ministry of Social Solidarity, (MOSS).

One of the project's main support factors was networking and cooperation between the project, MOSS and NCW. Networking and cooperation with MOSS and NCW was an excellent step in accelerating the process of getting security and administrative permits. However, there was no other networking between the project and any other entity that is interested in women economic empowerment.

Despite the cooperation, there were some interesting points as far as the quantitative part is concerned;

196 beneficiaries, (98%), advised that their project was never visited by any other institution or CDA while 4 women, (2%), indicated the opposite. 196 beneficiaries, (98%), have indicated that the CDA has not helped them get funding from other institutions while 4 beneficiaries, (2%) confirmed the opposite. 174 beneficiaries, (87%), confirmed that they have not received any support either financial or technical from the NCW while 26 women, (13%), confirmed they have received support from the NCW either financial or technical to improve the project and participate in exhibitions. 197 women, (98.5%) confirmed that they have not received any support either financial or technical from MOSS while 3 women, (1.5%), confirmed the opposite.

#### VI.C.10. Equality between men and women/ Women Economic Empowerment/ Women Rights:

#### To what extent does the project respond to the socio-economic needs of women?

The project responds, to a great extent, to women economic and social needs, (education and health care and other basic need), where it has created a state of self-sufficiency inside the family. The following quantitative data shows this situation in numbers and percentages:

193 women, (98.5%) have confirmed that the project has helped them respond to their economic needs such as food and clothes while 3 women, (1.5%) have confirmed the opposite. 199, (99.5%) of the respondents indicated that the project has helped them with a better status. 196 women, (98%) have indicated that the project has helped in making other community members see beneficiaries in a positive way. 183 beneficiaries, (91.5%) have said "the project has increased my income. I knew how to do business" A total of 110 beneficiaries, (55%) said "I came to know more people who can open up more work opportunities for me". Also, 95 beneficiaries, (24.4%) said "there are many work opportunities ahead of me now". 155 beneficiaries, (77.9%) have confirmed that the project helped them with their children education while 147, (73.9%) advised that it has helped in paying debts. At the same time, 16 women, (8%) advised it has helped with the marriage of one of the children. Finally, 9 women, (4.5%) advised that the project did not help them with anything.

#### Has the project managed to promote greater equal opportunities between women and men?

- The project has promoted real economic empowerment opportunities for women. This has happened through 1) self-confidence where women realized they have a say in various areas especially as far as household affairs are related. 2) By preparing her for the labor market by acquiring skills and information through training so as to be a real entrepreneur.
- FGDs with men have proved that men are welcoming projects run by women. They can also be of great support to women. Such projects have proved that women have a say and a role to play.
- FGDs with women were no less. They have shown that women can be equal to man if they are given a true opportunity. They can give opinions and participate in the decision-making process. They have taken the whole burden of taking care of their households and meet their needs during the pandemic while men were laid off and sitting at home.
- Quantitatively speaking, 173 women, (86.5%) advised that the project has helped them to a great extent to be equal to men. There is no difference now between man and woman in work or household economics. At the same time, 27 women, (13.5%) denied this. This was mainly in Qena where this group said that the project did not help them to say there was no difference between man and woman.

#### Has the project managed to promote real economic empowerment of women?

The project has succeeded in providing real economic empowerment opportunities for women. This happened through promoting woman self-confidence inside the house or at community level now that she has her own project. What added to this success is that she was provided with a good package of training and was prepared for the labor market so she can be a good entrepreneur. Women in the project could meet household needs, expand in the project, save money, do project bookkeeping, and diversify project activities.

Quantitative data shows that 115 women, (57.5%), advised they are in control of the project and its management. Also, 54 women, (27%), advised they co-share the project with their husbands while 31 women, (15%), advised that she and her children manage the project.

Have the needs of the women been taken into consideration given the different contexts and needs in their local communities in the four target governorates?

Women needs were taken into consideration where women had the option to select their business vocation according to what suits their conditions, needs and consideration for prevailing social, economic, cultural, norms and traditions that prevail in the villages. This was an excellent step which is mainly due to the project flexibility.

### VI.C.11. Sustainable environmental management:

Have rights holders been sensitized to the importance of preserving, maintaining and protecting natural resources? Have inputs, techniques, technologies, and materials adapted to the environment of the intervention area been used?

Interviews in this area have revealed a number of facts: various interviews have indicated that beneficiaries have received orientation on environmental management, maintaining and protecting natural resources. They have, for example, in Beni-Suef, learned how to collect waste of poultry projects and sell it to be used as fertilizers. However, there was no mention of other stuff such as cloth left-over or cartoon boxes or detergents.

Quantitatively speaking, 111 women, (55.5%) have attended training workshops on environmental protection while 89 women (44.5%) denied that. They were mainly in Qena and Beni-Suef. 177 beneficiaries, (88.5%) have confirmed that their projects are not environmentally-hazardous while 23 women, (11.5%) have confirmed that their projects contain environmentally-hazardous components.

127 women, (63.5%) have benefited from related trainings on the recycling of their projects' waste while 73 beneficiaries, (36.5%), have stated the opposite, (e.g., never attended trainings).

The above shows there was a section on waste recycling, (not a full training) that was provided during the vocational trainings on how to get rid of the waste related to every project. This shows clearly in the poultry, sewing and detergent projects.

#### VI.C.12. Respect for cultural diversity:

Has an equitable, culturally respectful, and conscious participation of the different interests between and within the group involved been promoted?

Have different worldviews been considered; imaginary; value systems; logic of action and decision making; priorities; and knowledge of the participating individuals and groups? Have positive potentialities and/or possible sources of conflict or resistance related to cultural aspects been identified?

In the 4 governorates, the project took into consideration that meetings and trainings should be held during days away from those of the market or special events.

The FGD with men have pointed out that the project has not violated customs and traditions related to women. Most of the projects' transactions are taking place within the community, in safe spaces without any form of abuse. Even trainings were done in public places such as youth centers and CDA premises.

The FGD with women showed that the project has greatly considered women circumstances and condition. It took into consideration prevailing customs and traditions in selecting project location, meeting and training venues. Visits to the projects were also done based on prior contact with beneficiaries and in suitable times.

The above was supported by the following quantitative data:

Total of 195 women, (97.5%) advised that the project took into consideration customs and traditions of the community while 5 women, (2.5%) denied that, all in Beni- Suef. Also, total of 180 women, (90%), did not experience any conflicts after project implementation. At the same time, 20 beneficiaries, (10%), advised that they have experienced conflicts after project implementation and these were mostly domestic ones. These were in Beni-Suef, Sohag and Luxor. They were solved out through discussion, conviction and dialogue. Total of 193 women, 96.5% advised that the project took into consideration community customs and traditions related to women while 7, (3.5%) denied that and were all in Beni-Suef. Total of 177 women, (91.8%) out of 193 who said "yes", advised that this was done through: "When there is an upcoming visit, they inform me in due time to be prepared". At the same time, 16 women, (8.2%) added: 'If there is a meeting or event, they select suitable places for us as women'.

## VII.A.1. General results of the study - Conclusions of the evaluation

In light of the study thematic areas/ criteria, the following results/ conclusions have been reached:

- 1) The majority of the interviewees agreed that there was a change/ transformation in the way the community perceives woman where communities have moved from rigid traditions to more open modes of thinking though with some reservation still. (90% of participants indicated the community perception of women is "positive". They were in agreement there was a certain level of change/ transformation in the way community sees and perceives women now. To explain, community members, especially males, have moved from the rigid and traditional look to a more open but cautious one. They are normally caught in the conflict between believing in women's capabilities and customs and traditions that still see women in the traditional sense. For them and others such as CDA heads, community perspective of women has greatly changed to be more positive at various levels: for example, at family level, the woman is seen as the backbone of the family in many respects such as raising children, helping them with their education, responding to house needs such as clothing, food, etc. In addition, they see her right to economic participation as an important aspect as she can support her family given the COVID-19 pandemic and its impact on the economic conditions.
- 2) Though the pandemic is primarily a health issue, yet it resulted in global, national and local economic downturns with serious economic implications especially on the lives of the vulnerable families and communities. It has resulted in the loss of jobs, deterioration of income, devaluation, and inability to provide for basic life commodities and needs such as food, shelter, healthcare and education. This was confirmed by 100% of the interviewees who advised that their economic conditions have worsened with the advent of the pandemic.
- 3) The study has revealed that women can be a reliable source of support and security for the family. The study has shown the excellent role women have played during and in the post-pandemic period. For example, in some cases, as men were laid off, women had to go out and work to secure income for the family and respond to basic needs. In general, women were under great pressure where they had to work to secure income for the family and at the same time, had to take care of the Household and family members especially children. As is the case in rural communities, they had to take care of other members as well within the extended family sphere. This represented a real burden and a challenge to women. This was very clear in Beni-Suef. Around 96% of the women have confirmed that the communities have asked women to assume their economic role during the pandemic.
- 4) In terms of economic participation, the pandemic has brought to light the concept of equality more into focus through practical experience. Previously, women were seen as fit only to sit at home with no opportunity for real economic participation. There were three reasons for this in fact: 1) the study has revealed that there are some obstacles that prevent women from assuming their role in economic participation. One of such obstacles is family objection, (father, husband or son) to women's going out for fear of harassment, (57.3%). Another 56.3% advised that women fear to go out for cultural reasons where communities look with doubt at women who go out. This means that women who go outside the community were frequently looked at with low respect. There was also this conflict between the way a woman sees herself which is a self-perception and the way the community sees her is a collective social perception controlled by the sum of customs and traditions. Also, lack of knowledge and skills was a real issue for women's participation. Also, lack of self-confidence and fear to fail was another area of concern. The project could help solve such issues: first, upon identification, women were provided with the appropriate training package, (vocational and business-related) which has increased their self-confidence; in terms of project implementation, some of the beneficiaries do run their enterprises from home, (hoe-based) while others have their projects within the same community. So, they do not have to go out of the community frequently. Managing the project successfully has taken the psychological out of them where they feel afraid to fail no more. Thus, communities have started to look at women as equal to man in terms of going out to work or manage their own businesses and effectively contribute to economic activities. Community-wise, it is very clear that locals agree to idea of gender equality and inclusion in the majority of responses. About 94.5% of women have indicated so. This was obvious in Qena and Luxor.

- 5) In a more detailed manner, women were selected to participate in the projects based on well-defined and rigorous selection criteria as per the vulnerability assessment study which indicated that these women should be: 1)heads of households (divorced, separated or widows) between the ages of 21 and 40 as their husbands have become unemployed as a result of the pandemic 2) at least be able to read and write (literate) or completed their schooling; 3) preference should be given to households with a large number of children (3 children or more); 4) Having an irregular source of income from seasonal or casual labor, which makes them more prone to economic shocks; 5) Women who have any of the above criteria, and have a vocation, or know basic vocational skills; and are willing to work and earn a living from their micro or small income generating projects; 6) Not enrolled in any social protection schemes or receiving benefits from the Egyptian government. However, there should be flexibility in this criterion, in case some families receive Takafu'l or Karama benefits, as the amounts paid are minimal and does not elevate these families above the poverty line.; 7) Households with no or minimal assets such as household appliances such as fridge, cooker, etc., as well as poor housing conditions. This is an indication of their excessive vulnerability.
- 6) The study results have revealed that the project is suitable for the nature of the beneficiaries and the local communities, a fact that was confirmed by 100% of the women entrepreneurs. Among the reasons for such suitability is that women chose the type of project by themselves and in line with the market study. Also, the location of various IGAs is convenient for women entrepreneurs' movement where they work within the local communities and do not have to go out. The projects were, in fact, flexible. This means that such projects greatly consider the cultural dimension. We believe that one of the most important factors that helped women to succeed is criteria #5 in the selection criteria of beneficiaries "Women who have any of the above criteria, and have a vocation, or know basic vocational skills; and are willing to work and earn a living from their micro or small income generating projects". Women strong will and determination was a crucial factor combined with skill and knowledge) were excellent causes for success.
- 7) The evaluation results have shown that IGAs have helped women solve some of the household-related problems such as paying for house expenses, paying for children education fees and private tutoring, paying of accumulated debts due to money borrowed or household items that they bought in installments but failed to pay, meet basic needs, healthcare services which are normally expensive, buying children clothes, and others. The study has also provided a clear picture about the social life of beneficiaries. To explain, being able to pay off debts and other obligations has resulted in reducing domestic violence where the economic factor is a major cause for. Now in many of the projects husbands support their wives and in others are working with them where family solidarity has been regained.
- 8) Results have shown that project objectives are in total agreement with the local plans and Egypt's vision 2030 and the National Women Strategy road-map of 2030, as it is based on the concept of economic and social empowerment of women whose role as an active member was very clear at home and community level. The most important points here: 1) The equality between man and woman which aims at giving equal opportunities for man and woman which reflects Egypt' SDGs in the 2030 strategy; 2) Economic empowerment is considered an important axis in Egypt's NSW to combat poverty and overpopulation; 3) preserving the environment and reducing climate change through training on safe waste management; 4) Reduction of all forms of domestic violence against women; 5) Importance of education and adult literacy; 6) Fight child labor. Results have also indicated that the project concept and objectives have taken on board the Egyptian government response plan of protecting the population from the present economic impact of COVID-19 by helping improve the income of the target beneficiaries.

- 9) Project activities were consistent and integrated. Activities were done on a gradual and logical basis. The process started with the identification of the communities, applying selection criteria to identify the potential, beneficiaries, classification of beneficiaries according to vocation, provision of training, starting the projects, and applying the monitoring and evaluation component. This was like a process of building blocks in a coherent manner where each step builds on the other. This systematic approach has helped in generating good impact on the lives of the beneficiaries, their families and communities.
- 10) Results show that the project objective of "improved income and productive capacities of vulnerable women in 4 governorates of Upper Egypt" has been achieved. This was verified through having: 1) a good and qualified project team in place. The team was selected based on a clear job description and clear institutional standards. Also, a good training package was provided especially to the women leaders so they can provide guidance to project direct beneficiaries. 2) Having a technical cadre capable of monitoring the project through the TIUWs; 3) the proper selection of project beneficiaries according to a well-defined selection criteria, (please see point #7 above). .4) having a monitoring system with documented records; 4) the increase in the project capital which was evident in the success stories.
- 11) MOSS representatives in all governorates have confirmed the obvious alignment and complementarity between the project objectives and activities and the MOSS social protection programs such as Takaful and Karama. The project is, in fact, encouraging the change and move from "need" to "production". The Forsa program of MOSS is perfectly compatible with this project where it aims to move from need to production through preparation of entrepreneurs. Further, project results comply with MOSS social protection programs in terms of logic, vision and objectives.
- 12) With reference to the training venues, and training impact, women advised that the training places were well-selected in terms of convenience and proximity. This was applicable to theoretical trainings. For vocational trainings, beneficiaries needed to attend them at the city center but it was not a problem. The project has made a great impact and change in the lives of the beneficiaries especially through the trainings they received at the beginning. Such trainings are considered transformation trainings that helped in a number of ways: first, beneficiaries regained their self-confidence; second, it marked the beginning of a new era that took the beneficiaries from their dark state to a new period of hope; third, they have generated a sense of worth for the beneficiaries that they can generate impact to their socio-economic surroundings; fourth, they have ensured that beneficiaries are fully geared up to start the new project..
- 13) Results have shown that some direct beneficiaries have passed their experience to non-project beneficiaries, (other women living in the local community). This was found in all governorates and mainly in Beni Suef. This is an excellent step that shows community solidarity and willingness to help one another.
- 14) Results have also revealed that some beneficiary women have diversified the project activities, (that is to add another activity to the current/ basic activity) in an attempt to expand the project to generate more income. For example, a woman with a poultry project might be doing sewing as an additional source of income". This was found in all governorates.
- 15) The project is characterized by being technically and financially sustainable. This can be seen in the technical follow-up and support provided by the women leaders which is done according to a systematic plan. Another element of technical sustainability is the package of trainings that provided them with necessary information and skills to run their projects. Financial sustainability can be seen in the increase of project capital, maintaining updated records and ensuring ongoing bookkeeping, beneficiary financial contributions to the project and diversification in project activities.

16) In terms of calculating quantitative improvement in the life of the beneficiaries, the study shows that:

Average income before project	% families before the project	% families after the project
<le1000< td=""><td>72.5%</td><td>3%</td></le1000<>	72.5%	3%
LE1000 - <le2000< td=""><td>20.5%</td><td>64.5%</td></le2000<>	20.5%	64.5%
> LE2000	4%	32.5%
No income	3%	0%

#### Among the major findings also:

- √ 3% families had income increase of LE1500 or more
- √ 22.5% families had income increase between LE1000 LE1500
- √ 44.5% of the families had income increase of LE500-LE1000
- √ 30% families had income increase of LE500
- 17) Findings show that local partners and stakeholders were invited to participate in events such as the launching of the project, MOSS heads, some of the NCW representatives, beneficiaries and women leaders participated in delivering the IGAs as well as participating in meetings as part of the project technical committee. This is very important to build on. It is also important to keep doing this process on a consistent basis.
- 18) Results have identified networking and cooperation with MOSS and NCW as an excellent tool in accelerating the process of getting security and administrative permits. This cooperation is necessary to facilitate issues related to areas of concern such as approvals, for example or other issues that might come up in the local community and related to MOSS.

### VII.A.2. Lessons learned

- ✓ For other similar projects that are run by women, (especially in Upper Egypt), it is crucial to engage males and elderly women from the beginning to give support to beneficiary women. Customs and traditions have a major say where the final decision to get women involved in activities is up to the husband/ father or elderly women, (mother or mother-in-law). So, it is important to include them particularly in the awareness raising sessions (gender and inclusion) as this process proved to be successful in making men more understandable and supportive of women, (as primary target) cause and issues.
- ✓ One of the elements of project sustainability is related to administrative procedures. In order to ensure continuity, the IGAS should be formally legalized (health certificate, commercial register, tax card, etc.) especially if they intend to expand. This process takes a lot of time and financial resources, so what has been done to date is considered appropriate.
- ✓ For other similar future projects, train project team on project evaluation to strengthen their skill in this area. It is important for any project team to understand how to utilize evaluation recommendations for any forthcoming projects.

#### VII.A.3 Evaluation Recommendations

- If there are plans to phase into new communities, it is important to update any market study beforehand as communities vary from one another in terms of needs and required/ preferred activities to be implemented. This was very clear in the ended project where women were given the option to identify the kind of project they can be successful at where some have chosen poultry, others have identified sewing, and others preferred to work in detergents and so on.
- ◆ It is recommended to include Refresher trainings to women leaders (responsible of the TIUWs), so that they can continue providing guidance to beneficiaries.
- ◆ As happened in the previous project and also in the upcoming, when conducting training for CBOs, it is important for the training to include a section on how to involve women in the planning process of the gender and economic empowerment component. This recommendation is based on the fact that they have accumulated a great deal of experience now at both theoretical and practical levels which allows them to talk for themselves.
- ◆ Support the marketing area through assisting beneficiaries in opening new markets. This means that one of the possible roles of the CDA is to help women find new market outlets to sell their products and hence get a wider exposure that can lead to increase in their profits.
- Continue organizing awareness raising sessions (as the ones run in a previous project developed by GFD and CONEMUND and next ones that will be done in next project that will be developed by GFD and CONEMUND), to community members (especially communities that host projects run by women), on the importance of women economic participation. This will take away the negative look that still exists for some dwellers of such communities.
- Continue the exchange of experience process among entrepreneurs within the same governorate and among the four governorates through exchange of visits to learn from each other on similar projects.
- For future similar projects that can be implemented in other locations, it would be good to promote successful examples from locations where the project was implemented. This has the purpose of exposing successful examples, avoiding problem areas and sharing good lessons.
- Encourage beneficiaries to expand their geographical scope through participation in exhibitions or selling points. Also encourage them to do e-marketing and link up to e-platforms. Expand the idea of added value by means of which, each beneficiary would extend her experience to three-five other women.
- Establish coordination and cooperation mechanism with other similar entities for exchange of experience, (e.g., other CDAs). The exchange could take place at two levels: 1) beneficiary level to learn from the projects on the ground as advised above; 2) to help CDA staff who are planning similar activities to learn from those who have already implemented such activities.
- Provide CBOs with more space and active participation in project management and participation in planning, monitoring and evaluation. This will enable them with future sustainability of projects.
- Ensure the concept of cash circulation within the community is kept intact: that is the businesswomen sell to and buy from each other as well as from other people in the same community which creates integration.
- Sustainable environmental management is very important for any IGA. In fact, the implemented IGAs are in line with the Egyptian and international acts where they are causing no pollution. The types of IGAs that beneficiaries are running along with the environmental awareness sessions are contributing to an improved environment. We recommend this process should continue in new/ upcoming IGAs. Whether it is training or awareness the process has to continue emphasizing environmental management, protection and waste recycling.

# Appendix 1

"Increase of Income and Productive Capacities of Women Heads of Family, in Upper Egypt, Regarding the Economic Impact of COVID-19" Project

Code: 2020/PRYC/000865

**Final Evaluation** 

# Field work (Field memory) report:

Submitted to

**CONEMUND/ Gozour Foundation** 

Submitted by:

NRCHROD, (NRC Consulting)

August 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2023

47 Hamed Abdel Azim STREET, Giza, EGYPT

TEL/ Mobile: 0100-1426-742; 0100-1426-743; 0100-233-4212; 01000105842

www.nrchrod.org

#### **Background:**

CONEMUND and GOZOUR have been working on a project to support vulnerable women in four governorates in Upper Egypt, (Beni Suef, Sohag, Qena and Luxor). The project is funded by the Spanish Agency of International Cooperation and Development, (AECID). The project started on 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2021 and scheduled for completion by 21<sup>st</sup> October 2023, (24 months).

## The report

As per agreement, there is an evaluation process to be conducted for the project. According to the approved action plan, this evaluation process should be completed in 4 phases: <a href="mailto:phase1">phase 1</a>: preparation, inception report, desk review, tool design, and sampling. <a href="Phase III">Phase III</a>: data collection, review and quality check and report on field work, (field memory report), data entry and analysis, and generating report of results. <a href="Phase III">Phase III</a>: draft study report and joint review. <a href="Phase IV">Phase IV</a>: communication plan and dissemination of final report of results.

This report covers phase II of the evaluation process up to field memory section. It covers the following areas: data collection, review and quality check). This stage took place between 27<sup>th</sup> July 2023 and 22<sup>nd</sup> August 2023. This stage covers actual data collection from the field and submission of the field work/ field memory report. Report elements are:

- 1. Project title:
- 2. Report title:
- 3. Objective of the report:
- 4. Purpose of data collection:
- 5. Who managed which forms?
- 6. Preparation
- 7. Number of planned interviews
- 8. Number of completed interviews
- 9. Number of incomplete interviews and reasons
- 10. What was the contingency plan (to make up for the incomplete interviews)
- 11. Challenges
- 12. How they were dealt with
- 13. Lessons learned
- 14. Recommendations
- 15. Next steps, (way forward)

### **Detailed description:**

<u>Project title:</u> "Increase of Income and Productive Capacities of Women Heads of Family, in Upper Egypt, Regarding the Economic Impact of COVID-19"

Report title: Field work, (Field memory report).

<u>Objective of the report:</u> Present a full picture on the field phase as related to collection of qualitative and quantitative data on the project for its final evaluation.

<u>Purpose of data collection:</u> Provide a context and ground for the evaluation process to take place so it can provide a sound reflection of the project impact on the beneficiaries and their lives

<u>Preparation</u>: The overarching approach that was applied through different steps was the application of the participatory approach which has proved to be very effective. The preparation and coordination between the study team and CONEMUND, Gozour and the target communities was excellent and all arising issues were resolved on the spot, (e.g., coordination and selection of venue, timelines and targets). Good planning was obvious in notifying different targets prior to the actual process of data collection. Necessary forms (e.g., Questionnaire, FGDs, KIIs, CSs and MSCs) were distributed among assigned data collectors, different appointments were booked, and provision of contingency plans was made, (e.g., in case of unavailability of a certain person another appointment would be scheduled).

In terms of who managed which forms, Questionnaires were completed by the data collectors while the KIIs, FGDs, Case studies and MSCs were conducted by the Senior Field Supervisors. This is because these four latter items require a significant level of experience in conducting qualitative field research. Also, proper ethical considerations were taken into account e.g., introducing the purpose of the visit, getting stakeholders consent for the interviews, ensuring privacy of women during interviews, reviewing replies with them upon completion of the interviews and informing them on how the data will be utilized.

### Data collection:

Data collection took place on the period from 27<sup>th</sup> July and was concluded by 15<sup>th</sup> August, 2023 including actual data collection, review and cleaning of the collected data prior to the stage of data entry. This included:

- Number of planned interviews
- Number of completed interviews
- Number of incomplete interviews and reasons
- Contingency plan (to make up for the incomplete interviews)

The following table presents planned interviews and actual completed.

Tool	Questionnaire (Women)		KII (CDA		KII (ITU		FGD		FGD		Case study		MSC		KII (MOSS		KII (technical	
			chairman)		leaders)		(males)		(females)		(Women)		(Women)		and NCW)		partners	
Gover.	Planned	Done	planned	Done	planned	Done	planned	Done	planned	Done	planned	Done	planned	Done	planned	Done	planned	Done
Sohag	50	50	1	1	2	2	1	0	1	1	2	2	4	4	2	2	1	1
Sohag	50	50	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	2	4	4	2	2	1	1
Beni	50	50	1	1	2	2	1	1	1	1	2	2	4	4	2	2	1	1
Suef																		
Luxor	50	50	1	1	2	2	1	1	1	1	2	2	4	4	2	2	1	1
Total	200	200	4	4	7	7	4	3	4	4	8	8	16	16	8	8	4	4

The above table explains the situation in terms of interviews that were planned to be administered and actual number of interviews that have taken place on the ground. According to the table, all planned targets were completed as planned and have even exceeded expectations in some of them as in the case of FGDs in Luxor and Qena where the number of males who wanted to attend the discussions exceeded the number. However, only one FGD for men in Beni-Suef was not conducted. Although we provided room to reduce the number of participants per group to 6 people, yet the CDA could not bring the required number and brought only two men which was not statistically valid to organize the FGD.

Also, all FGDs for women were conducted smoothly as planned with no obstacles. Various discussions have revealed excellent answers which will be analyzed, captured and interpreted in the final report. In addition, one KII was planned for one leader woman in the ITU in Beni-Suef. The interview was not conducted on the assigned time due to a death case in the woman's family. Finally, the interview was rescheduled towards the end of the field part and was finally conducted.

#### Interviews with CONEMUND and Gozour:

Entity	Entity	Status					
CONEMUND	KII with Country Representative	Completed					
	KII with Project Manag	Completed					
Gozour	KII with Project Coordinator/ Manaer	Completed					
	KIIs with Project front-line staff	Mr. Hesham Salah advised that the only					
		frontline staff are the 8 women leaders.					
		These were already met					
	KII with M&E officer at main office	Mr. Hesham Salah advised that this					
		position does not exist					
	KII with Gender Advisor at main office	Mr. Hesham Salah advised that this					
		position does not exist					

### Challenges and how they were dealt with:

No real challenges or obstacles were met during the field implementation part of the study except for the FGD that could not take place in Beni-Suef for males. The successful implementation of data collection in four governorates was due to the good planning, strong coordination, flexibility and cooperation between the evaluation team and all concerned parties.

## **Lessons learned and recommendations:**

- Proper early planning prevents problems and helps achieve work successfully and easily
- Working with an organized team yields quality results
- It is important to have contingency plans in place in case any unexpected incident might happen
- Given the context of the local communities and Upper Egypt in particular, it is important to inform the interviewees in due time, (for fear that husbands or elderly women in the family might prevent them from attending the interviews). This has helped a lot in completing the required number of interviews
- It is always important to approach local communities through CDAs which are trusted by locals and provide legitimacy to the visitors, (e.g. the evaluation team)
- It is important to have clear roles and responsibilities for every member in the evaluation team to avoid contradiction.

## Next steps, (way forward):

Over the next period, the following activities are planned to take place:

- Data cleaning;
- Data entry;
- Data analysis
- Generate report of completed analysis.

This is a part of **phase II** which is expected to be completed by 31<sup>st</sup> August 2023. **Phase III** will then follow where the final report is expected to be developed and then **phase IV** which is concerned with the communication and dissemination of the final report of results.

# **Appendix 2**









# **Terms of reference**

for external final evaluation consultancy of the project:

"Increase of income and productive capacities of women heads of family, in Upper Egypt, regarding the economic impact of COVID-19"

Code: 2020/PRYC/000865

# **March 2023**

## **INDEX**

1.	INTRODUCTION	3
2.	PROJECT OVERVIEW	4
3.	STAKEHOLDERS INVOLVED IN THE EVALUATION	8
4.	OBJECTIVES OF THE EVALUATION	9
5.	EVALUATION CRITERIA	9
6.	METHODOLOGY AND WORK PLAN	13
7.	DOCUMENTS PROVIDED BY THE BENEFICIARY ENTITY	14
8.	STRUCTURE AND PRESENTATION OF THE REPORT	14
9. LE	CONDITIONS AND CRITERIA FOR THE SELECTION OF THE NATURAL OR GAL PERSON	16
10.	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
SA	NCTIONS REGIME	16
11.	DELAYS AND EXPECTED BUDGET	17
12	PRESENTATION OF THE PROPOSAL.	17

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

The general objective of these Terms of Reference (ToR) is to establish the mandatory framework for **conducting an external final evaluation of the Project** "Increase of income and productive capacities of women heads of family, in Upper Egypt, regarding the economic impact of COVID-19", code 2020/PRYC/000865, with the general objective "To contribute to protect the human rights of those most affected by COVID-19 in Egypt".

"This project is based on a previous joint work experience of CONEMUND and Gozour Foundation for Development - GFD (local partner) in Egypt. Both organizations have worked together in the same intervention area and with the same community-based organizations (CBOs), in a project co-financed by the European Union (EU) with the aim to combat violence against women and promote gender equality in Rural Upper Egypt (EU, 2019-2021). This project expands and deepens the results and lessons learned from this intervention and contributes to minimizing the socioeconomic impact of the COVID-19 crisis in the area.

GFD is an Egyptian non-profit organization registered under the Ministry of Social Solidarity, No.7885/2010. The Foundation was established to become a catalytic agent in tackling the underlying causes of underdevelopment and supporting the advancement of Egyptians to rejuvenate themselves and become productive assets in society. GFD has a long history of implementing interventions that promote gender equality and the economic empowerment of women (promoting employability, labour insertion, access to income and strengthening of capacities).

CONEMUND is a Spanish non-governmental and independent organization that was established in 1997 with the objective of promoting international cooperation for the economic and social development of developing countries. The actions of CONEMUND aim to improve these countries' living conditions arced by poverty, disease, lack of education and marginality.

In the Maghreb and Middle East (Egypt, Morocco, Jordan, and Palestinian Territories), CONEMUND has been working for more than 20 years, specifically in Egypt since 2005. The priority work sector has been the defence of women's rights, the fight against harmful practices towards girls and women, and the empowerment of women (economic, social and political spheres). All the interventions have been funded by the Spanish Agency of International Cooperation (AECID) and the European Union (EU).

This project has been financed by the Spanish Agency of International Cooperation for Development (AECID) in its Call for Proposals 2020; and it has been executed by GFD and CONEMUND since 22 October 2021. The execution of the project took place over 24 months. Therefore, the project execution completion date is 21 October 2023.

The general objective of this external evaluation is to take stock of the achievements of the project and determine the degree of fulfilment of the objectives set on the basis of the evaluation criteria that allow evaluating the level of achievement of the objectives, results and indicators of the intervention. Also this evaluation should serve as to know the performance of the project, to identify good practices, lessons learned and aspects that need to be improved and, finally, to formulate pertinent recommendations to improve future interventions and the sustainability of the project.

#### 2. PROJECT OVERVIEW

#### 2.1 Context and rationale

Egypt is a country with a population of more than 104 million people (49.47% women). In 2019, the Human Development Index was 0,73 (UNDP 2021-2022), which places it in the group of countries with medium Human Development, occupying position 91 out of a total of 191. In the Global Gender Gap Index of the 2022 World Economic Forum, Egypt has been ranked 129 out of a list of 146 countries, with position 142 in economic participation and position 78 in the political participation.

Women's contribution to the formal labour market is weak. According to data provided by UN Women, women represent 23.8% of the employed active population, compared to a rate of 73% for men and an unemployment rate 2.5 times higher than that of men. In addition, those who manage to enter the labour market often do so in precarious conditions and with lower salaries than men.

The project takes place in Upper Egypt; In this area, both the levels of poverty (51% of the country's poor population and 73.6% of the very poor population), as well as the situation of vulnerability of women and gender gaps are higher than those existing in other areas of the country. Agriculture is the main source of income for families in the area. Women, in addition to the primary sector, are often employed in domestic work, processing and selling food or clothing.

Regarding COVID-19, according to data from the Egyptian Ministry of Health, as of 09/08/20, 100,041 confirmed cases had been registered, including 5,541 deaths. The capacity of the hospital infrastructure for the treatment of the coronavirus was saturated at that time. The corona crisis has posed a serious threat to the country's fragile economy, producing a slowdown in economic growth (decrease in income from tourism, the Suez Canal and foreign remittances estimated at 20-30%), the decrease in Gross Domestic Product (estimated at 4.8%), the rise in the prices of basic products and the decrease in household income.

According to the CAPMAS 2020 report (Statistical Data Publication Agency in Egypt), 61.9% of jobs have been affected by the pandemic and 41% of households have not had sufficient income to cover the needs of their families. The unemployment rate currently stands at 26%. The report also indicates that it is the rural areas of the country, such as Upper Egypt, that have been hardest hit by the devastating consequences of COVID-19.

Women who worked in precarious jobs, without the ability to save, are the most affected. Most of them have lost their jobs or have been forced to leave it due to the increased care work that has occurred. Among them, the women who are permanently responsible economically or socially for children or disabled people whom they must care for have been the ones who have faced a serious lack of income and greater difficulties in satisfying their basic needs and access to the labour market.

COVID-19 has seriously damaged the female labour market and it is urgent to find solutions that promote the economic empowerment of women. Entrepreneurship is currently emerging as the way to overcome the lack of job opportunities.

# 2.2 Project objectives

GO	To contribute to protect the human rights of those most affected by COVID-19 in Egypt			
so	Improved income and productive capacities of vulnerable women in 4 governorates of Upper Egypt			

# 2.3 Expected results

Four (4) results are expected from the execution of the project.

<b>R.1</b>	Strengthened the system of care for vulnerable women in Upper Egypt			
<b>R.2</b>	Strengthened the capacities of vulnerable women to promote an increase their income			
<b>R.3</b>	Income-generating activities managed by vulnerable women			
<b>R.4</b>	The monitoring of the project is shared by all its stakeholders (cross-sectional result)			

# **2.4 Indicators of results**

so	<ul> <li>I1.OE: In 24 months, 200 women trained in professional techniques and busine management present sustainable and bankable business proposals</li> <li>I2.OE: In 24 months, 200 Income Generating Activities running</li> <li>I3.OE. In 24 months, the income of self-entrepreneurs increases by 35%</li> </ul>				
R.1	<ul> <li>I1.R1: In the 1st quarter, 4 Training and Insertion Units for Women (TIUW) created and running to improve the economic integration of women</li> <li>I2.R1: In the 1st quarter, 8 Women Leaders are able to support and guide Vulnerable Women through the TIUW</li> <li>I3.R1. In the 1st semester, specific analyses are available to support the insertion of vulnerable women in the local market</li> </ul>				
<ul> <li>II.R2: In 14 months, 90% of the beneficiaries have integrated the knowledge into the vocational training courses</li> <li>I2.R2: In the first year, 90% of the beneficiaries have successfully paramagement training and are ready to start a personal entrepreneurship</li> </ul>					
R.3	• I1.R3: By the end of the project, 200 income-generating activities are operational and sustainable				
R.4	I1.R4:not applicable				

# 2.5 Project activities

R.1	<ul> <li>A1: Establishment of Training and Insertion Units for Women (TIUW) in 4 governorates of Upper Egypt.</li> <li>A2. Training of the staff (8 women leaders) of the Training and Insertion Units for Women of the 4 targeted CBOs.</li> <li>A3. Realization a vulnerability and capacity analysis/study in each targeted community.</li> <li>A4. Realization of a market study to identify market niches for services and products demanded in each targeted community.</li> </ul>
R.2	<ul> <li>A1. Selection of 200 vulnerable women (50 per CBO) from 4 governed by AE.</li> <li>A2. Workshops on business management for 200 vulnerable women.</li> <li>A3. Professional training workshops for 200 vulnerable women (3 professional training workshops per CBO).</li> </ul>
R.3	<ul> <li>A1. Financing of income-generating activities through a seed capital fund.</li> <li>A2. Holding meetings of women entrepreneurs.</li> <li>A3. Monitoring and supervision of income generating activities created.</li> </ul>
R.4	<ul> <li>A1. Project launching workshop.</li> <li>A2. Meetings of the Technical Monitoring Committee.</li> <li>A3. External evaluation.</li> <li>A4. A meeting for the presentation of the final results of the project.</li> </ul>

# 3. STAKEHOLDERS INVOLVED IN THE EVALUATION

ENTITY NAME	EXPECTED ROLE AND USE OF THE EVALUATION		
CONEMUND	Joint management of the evaluation and implementation of lessons learned.		
GFD	Joint management of the evaluation and implementation of lessons learned.		
Project evaluation follow-up committee	Joint management of the evaluation and implementation of lessons learned.  Monitoring of the evaluation work to guarantee that it is carried out under quality criteria and validate the different stages that make up the entire process.  In particular, the project monitoring committee will be in charge of:  - The identification of information needs.  - The methodological design and the consequent application of informative techniques.  - The interpretation of the findings and the feasibility of the recommendations.  The monitoring committee will be made up of several stakeholders with different tasks:  - CONEMUND, which will be present in all phases of the evaluation, monitoring it in all cases where possible.		
Spanish Agency for International Cooperation and Development (AECID)	The evaluation will take into account the evaluation priorities of the AECID as evaluation standards to adapt to the demands and information needs of CONEMUND and GFD. CONEMUND will be responsible for channelling the queries to the AECID, so that the agency approves the evaluation process and is informed of the steps and changes that could be made during progress.		
Technical Cooperation Office (OTC) of Egypt	The OTC will have an active role during the process. The OTC will receive a visit from the evaluation team when in order to assess and validate the evaluation design.		

#### 4. OBJECTIVES OF THE EVALUATION

The general objective of this assessment is to take stock of the project's achievements and determine the degree of fulfilment of the objectives set on the basis of the evaluation criteria that allow assessing the level of achievement of the objectives, results and indicators of the project, identify good practices, lessons learned and aspects that need to be improved and, finally, to formulate pertinent recommendations, to improve future interventions and the sustainability of the project.

### Specifically, the evaluation should:

- To measure the effects, impact and sustainability of the project after 24 months of intervention;
- To assess the level of achievement of the project results in terms of quantity, quality and deadlines;
- To analyse the achievement of the indicators in quantitative and qualitative terms;
- To analyse the approach used to carry out the activities;
- To analyse partnership relationships developed;
- To identify lessons learned and good practices;
- To identify the limitations, strengths and weaknesses of the action and to formulate recommendations and/or reorientations, in order to consolidate the results to guarantee the achievement of the effects:
- To compare the baseline indicators with the results achieved to determine the main impacts of the project on the target population.

#### 5. EVALUATION CRITERIA

The evaluation must verify that these quality criteria have been respected:

- Relevance
- Alignment
- Internal coherence of the intervention and management based on results
- Effectiveness
- Efficiency
- Impact
- Sustainability
- Appropriation and institutional strengthening
- Coordination and complementarity
- Gender (Equality between men and women/Women Economic Empowerment/ Women Rights)
- Sustainable environmental management
- Cultural diversity.

#### Relevance:

- Is the analysis of reality adjusted at the time of identification?
- Does the implemented strategy correspond to the needs defined in the local Plans?
- Does the intervention respond to the problems, needs and priorities of the target population?
- Was the proposed geographic and demographic coverage adequate?
- Etc.

## **Alignment:**

- Has the Sustainable Development Strategy: Egypt Vision 2030 and the National Women's Strategy 2030 (NWS) roadmap to support women's participation and their rights in Egypt been taken into account?
- Has the Government of Egypt's response plan to protect the population from the economic impact of COVID-19 been taken into account?
- Has the strategy to promote equality between women and men of the National Council for Women (NCW) at national, regional and local levels been taken into account?
- To what extent are the project activities aligned with the programs of the social protection "TAKAFUL" and "KARAMA" promoted by the Egyptian Ministry of Social Solidarity?
- Etc.

#### **Coherence:**

- Do the project activities respond to the current context of the rights holders?
- Are the different activities consistent with each other?
- How have project activities been coordinated with the Ministry of Social Solidarity (MoSS) and the National Council of Women (NCW)?
- Is the project management well-oriented towards results?
- Etc.

#### **Effectiveness:**

- To what extent has the specific objective described in the logical framework been achieved?
- What can it say about the results?
- Have the described activities been carried out according to the schedule/action plan?
- Were the activities focused on the results of the project?
- Etc.

#### **Efficiency:**

- Does the project budget fit the activities?
- Are the tools used in the activities adapted to the context?
- Was the project team responsive to the needs of the intervention? (job descriptions, organization structure, organization procedures)
- The geographical location of the places (TIUW, training and meeting facilities) has facilitated the proper development of activities?
- Etc.

#### **Impact:**

- Did the results of the project lead to a real and positive change in the lives of the beneficiaries?
- Has the system of indicators made it possible to measure the expected positive impacts?
- Have there been unexpected negative or positive effects? How has the project adapted to these positive or negative effects?
- Can an improvement in the quality of life of the women participating in the project be quantified?
- Have women been harmed by the project? (in the division of labour, in the access and control of resources).
- Etc.

### **Sustainability:**

- Have solid commitments been generated with the institutions that hold obligations to guarantee the results obtained?
- Have the appropriate mechanisms and procedures been put in place to guarantee the availability of the necessary resources to maintain the activities once the intervention has ended?
- Is the project technically and financially sustainable?
- Has the position of women improved as a result of the project? Have practical or strategic needs been addressed so that women can make more decisions?
- Will the changes be sustainable?
- Etc.

## **Appropriation and institutional strengthening:**

- To what extent have the local partner and key stakeholders participated in the design, management, development/execution, monitoring, and evaluation of the intervention?
- To what extent have rights holders/beneficiaries engaged and participated in achieving the objectives and results?
- To what extent has the initiative been taken up by the local partner and rights holders?
- Have they provided resources (financial, labour, etc.) for the intervention?
- How have rights holders participated in this evaluation process?
- Etc.

## **Coordination and complementarity (added value and concentration)**

- How have project activities been coordinated with other stakeholders in the area that promote women's economic empowerment, such as other local, national and international organisations?
- How have project activities been coordinated with public institutions that promote women's empowerment such as the National Council of Women (NCW) and the Ministry of Social Solidarity (MoSS)?
- Etc.

#### Equality between men and women/ Women Economic Empowerment/ Women Rights:

- To what extent does the project respond to the socioeconomic needs of women?
- Has the project managed to promote greater equal opportunities between women and men?
- Has the project managed to promote real economic empowerment of women?
- Has the needs of the women been taken into consideration given the different contexts and needs in their local communities in the four targeted governorates?
- Etc.

#### **Sustainable environmental management:**

- Have rights holders been sensitized to the importance of preserving, maintaining and protecting natural resources?
- Have inputs, techniques, technologies and materials adapted to the environment of the intervention area been used?
- Etc

## Respect for cultural diversity:

- Has an equitable, culturally respectful, and conscious participation of the different interests between and within the groups involved been promoted?
- Have different worldviews been considered; imaginary; value systems; logic of action and decision making; priorities; and knowledge of the participating individuals and groups?
- Have positive potentialities and/or possible sources of conflict or resistance related to cultural aspects been identified? Etc.

#### 6. METHODOLOGY AND WORK PLAN

The methodological techniques that will be used to carry out the evaluation of the intervention will be the analysis of documents, field work, as well as interviews and discussion groups.

## The products to be obtained are:

- Preliminary report resulting from the desk study: before carrying out the work in the field, the consultation team will present its work plan, schedule, methodology (planned tools) and a list of planned interviews, so that CONEMUND and GFD can examine them and to make comments and suggestions.
- Field memory result of field work: the main conclusions of the field work.
- Draft evaluation report: this report will be presented to CONEMUND and GFD, who will be able to add comments and suggestions for inclusion in the final report.
- Final evaluation report: it will be delivered in English.
- Communication plan and dissemination of the evaluation and its results.

The phases and deadlines foreseen for carrying out the evaluation are the following:

PHASES	Month 1 (June 2023)	Month (July 2023)	Month 3 (August 2023)	Month 4 (September 2023)
Preliminary report	X			
Field memory		X		
Draft evaluation report			X	
Joint Review Interim Report			X	
Final evaluation report				X
Communication plan and				
dissemination of the evaluation				X
and its results				

#### 7. DOCUMENTS PROVIDED BY THE BENEFICIARY ENTITY

These documents will be made available to the evaluation team. In addition to the documents mentioned here, the evaluation team may request from the NGOs (CONEMUND and GFD) any additional documentation that it deems appropriate to carry out its work.

- Logical framework, schedule and budget of the project.
- Reports made in the project (including analysis of vulnerability and capacities in each community of action and market study in the areas of action).
- AECID regulations.
- Intermediate and final report.
- Project verification sources.
- Other documentation considered relevant for the evaluation.

#### 8. STRUCTURE AND PRESENTATION OF THE REPORT

The structure of the report will be as follows:

- a) Implementation summary, including OECD (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development) /DAC (The Development Assistance Committee data sheet.
- b) Introduction: background, general data and objectives of the evaluation.
- c) Description of the objective and context of the evaluation.
- d) Methodological and technical approach used in the evaluation: evaluation questions, methodologies and techniques applied and limitations of the evaluation carried out.
- e) Analysis or reflection focused on resilience on the key elements that ensure the sustainability of the project.
- f) Analysis and interpretation of the information gathered and evaluation results. The analysis of the information must respond to the evaluation criteria and questions. Focusing especially on compliance with the contents of the logical framework (objectives, results, activities and indicators). To what extent the project activities conform to the official control strategy documents.
- g) Conclusions of the evaluation related to the evaluation criteria. The conclusions must be drawn from the analysis of the information collected and must be presented in accordance with the evaluation criteria.
- h) Lessons learned that emerge from the general conclusions that indicate good practices and that can be extrapolated and feed back into the actions of future interventions.
- i) Evaluation recommendations. It must be indicated to whom the recommendations are addressed (AECID, CONEMUND, GFD, others).
- j) Executive summary of the report in Arabic.
- k) Measures adopted to disseminate the evaluation.
- l) The annexes, which will include the ToR, the work plan, the composition and description of the mission, the proposed methodology, techniques and sources used to collect information and the evaluation summary sheet (DAC model).

Although the interim report may be reviewed by consensus by the monitoring committee with the rest of the agents, the evaluation team must present its evaluation in writing, even if the grant beneficiary or other agents disagree. Points of disagreement can always be clarified.

As a general rule, the final evaluation report will not exceed 40 pages. The report will be presented in the form of a hard copy and an electronic copy. The report must be written in English and CONEMUND will take care of its translation in Spanish for subsequent transmission to the AECID.

An internal briefing session and a final restitution (extended to other stakeholders) of the observations and recommendations will close the service.

# 9. CONDITIONS AND CRITERIA FOR THE SELECTION OF THE NATURAL OR LEGAL PERSON

The conditions for the natural or legal person are the following:

- Previous experience: 2 years of evaluation of public policies, particularly in the field of cooperation.
- Not having participated in the identification or execution phases of the project.
- The natural or legal person must have the following experience:
- Experience in the action sector.
- Experience in social research techniques.
- Work experience in Egypt.
- In the case of an evaluation team, it must be multidisciplinary.

The people or entities that carry out the evaluation must indicate the number of members of their team and the functions of each one, as well as the name of the person who will assume the role of coordinator. As far as possible, efforts will be made to include professionals from the country or region in which the intervention takes place and to respect gender balance.

#### Procedure for submitting an offer:

Interested candidates must send their technical and financial proposals by email before 28/02/2023: <a href="mailto:esther.jimenez@conemund.org">esther.jimenez@conemund.org</a> and hsalah@gozour.org

# 10. PREMISES OF THE EVALUATION, AUTHOR AND PUBLICATION, AND SANCTIONS REGIME

The natural or legal person conducting the assessment must be sensitive to women rights and equality between women and men, ethnic origin, age, sexual orientation, language and other considerations. Likewise, human rights must be respected, as well as cultural differences, customs, beliefs and religious practices of all the agents involved in the evaluation process.

It will be necessary to ensure the integrity, independence, credibility and transparency of the evaluation. The natural or legal person in charge of carrying out the evaluation must work with complete freedom and without interference, having access to all available information, according to the principles of ethical and professional behaviour.

The anonymity and confidentiality of the participants in the evaluation will be guaranteed.

The ownership of the evaluation report will correspond to the AECID, which may disseminate and divulge their content, in whole or in part.

The evaluation report must comply with the quality standards of the evaluations carried out by the AECID.

#### 11. DELAYS AND EXPECTED BUDGET

The term to carry out the evaluation is 45 days from the signing of the contract for the provision of services.

In exchange for his work, the consultant will receive the full sum of  $\in$  7.000. The consultant is responsible for the payment of all taxes in accordance with local legislation.

The payment methods will be the following:

- An advance of 30% after signing the service contract.
- A second advance of 40% after the presentation of the interim report.
- 30% after delivery of the final report.

Payment will be done from CONEMUND through the Spanish bank account of the NGO. The bank account must be under the name of the consultant and must be able to receive the payment in Egyptian pounds (the equivalent in Euros will be sent with the equivalent exchange rate at the time of payment).

#### 12. PRESENTATION OF THE PROPOSAL AND SCALE ELEMENTS

The documentation to be submitted by the evaluating entity is the following:

- Name and details of the company/person/team responsible for the evaluation.
- Proposal of the evaluation team, attaching complete CV.
- A technical proposal specifying:
- The understanding of the mission;
- The work plan that responds to the present ToR;
- The proposed methodology for the evaluation exercise;
- The execution schedule;
- The expected staff.
- A financial proposal specifying:
- The total cost of the evaluation in euros ( $\in$ ) and in local currency (Egyptian pounds), respecting the available budget ( $\in$  7.000) and in coherence with the proposed work plan.
- Express declaration of the person in charge or of the natural or legal person proposed to carry out the evaluation of not having maintained professional relations or exchanged services neither with CONEMUND nor with GFD during the identification or execution phases of the project, regarding their experience in evaluation of public policies, their non-involvement in the management of any element of the intervention and their respect for confidentiality, as well as their ethical behaviour and their respect for cultural diversity and gender equality in carrying out their work.

The evaluation criteria will be the following:

CRITERIA	Maximum score	Percentage
1. Technical quality of the proposal	3 points	30%
2. <b>Work methodology.</b> The level of concretion of the methodology, adaptation to the context, description of the work tools and work plan are valued.	3 points	30%
3. Professional profile and CV of the evaluation team. Technical training and experience in evaluation, in the sector, in the area of action and the application of the gender perspective are valued; as well as the gender diversity of the evaluation team	3 points	30%
4. Degree of detail and adequacy of the budget for the work to be carried out.	1 point	10%
TOTAL	10 points	100%

The awarding of the evaluation exercise will be formalized once AECID approves the choice of the candidate previously presented by CONEMUND.

The successful bidder undertakes to carry out the contract himself, and the assignment or subcontracting of the project to a third party is expressly prohibited.

NB: For additional information, please contact: Esther Jiménez, CONEMUND Delegate in Egypt at <a href="mailto:esther.jimenez@conemund.org">esther.jimenez@conemund.org</a> and Hesham Salah GFD Project Coordinator at <a href="mailto:hsalah@gozour.org">hsalah@gozour.org</a>